	UNHCR Evaluation Management Response							
Evaluation title:	Performance Evaluation of the Misizi Marshlands Agricultural Project Among Refugees And Host Communities in Gisagara District, Rwanda							
UNHCR evaluation reference:	ES/2022/59109							
Entity that commissioned the evaluation:	UNHCR Rwanda							
Due date of Management Response:	04 April, 2023							
Coordinator of Management Response:	Anne-Lyse Bizindavyi							
Management Response approved by (senior manager in commissioning office):  Name: Aissatou Masseck Dieng-Job title: Representative  Country/Office: UNHCR Rwanda								
Date:	04 April 2023							

General comments on the evaluation:	
RECOMMENDATION 1:	Recommendation 1 – Operational: UNHCR in partnership with the cooperative should establish a process for regular (annual) participatory performance review of the Icyerekezo Misizi cooperative.  Recommended actions:  • Specifically, it is recommended that the Misizi project applies evaluation findings to establish a process for regular (recommended annual) participatory performance review of the Icyerekezo cooperative that will improve transparency and cooperative management. This would provide evidence for specific next steps to improve cooperative governance, management, and operations.
	<ul> <li>It is recommended that this is a system and process developed with the cooperative and identifies appropriate levels of support from UNHCR. Leading practice globally and in Rwanda typically uses the following domains for cooperative review: viability of business plan, communication strategies between cooperative leadership and members, cooperative management adjustments post-COVID-19 meeting restrictions, accounting and budget management processes, female participation in leadership roles within the cooperative, services provided to members, services the cooperative would</li> </ul>

		infrastructure esta	nembers but do not currently do so, and capa blished through this project	city of the cooperativ	e to sustain main	tenance on
	agement response:	□ Agree x □Partially a	agree Disagree			
Reas	sons (if partially agree or disagree):					
Unit	or function responsible:	UNHCR Huye FO				
				Expected	Pro	gress
Тор-	line planned actions	By whom	Comments	completion date	Status	Comments
1	The Rwanda Cooperatives Agency (RCA) as per Chap. 11 of the Law N° 024/2021 of 27/04/2021 Governing Cooperatives in Rwanda, is in charge of Cooperatives promotion. Its mandate, among others, is to monitor cooperatives' viability and governance using various tools such as participatory performance review by members  UNHCR FO to support the Misizi marshlands multi-stakeholders' coordination committee to engage the Gatsibo District RCA to conduct the annual monitoring exercise of the Icyekerezo cooperative for 2023 and ensure that the Cooperative satisfactorily implements all recommendations of the monitoring	UNHCR Huye FO.	<ul> <li>During the Icyekerezo Cooperative Quarterly Coordination Meetings chaired by the District, UNHCR Huye FO shall be pro-active and request the District to call upon RCA to conduct the regular annual inspection of the cooperative as per the Law Governing Cooperatives in Rwanda.</li> <li>LH Staff at Huye FO shall make sure that the Cooperative's General Assembly meets to assess and approve the RCA's recommendations.</li> <li>LH Staff at Huye FO to follow-up with the cooperative leadership to make sure that an action plan for the implementation of recommendations is drawn and approved for implementation</li> <li>LH Staff at Huye FO will share with Livelihoods BOK the minutes of the Cooperative's GA meeting approving the implementation of the recommendations made by RCA's inspection (or by any other entity mandated by RCA, e.g., the District).</li> </ul>	31/05/2023		

2	Depending on the availability of funding, UNHCR FO and its partners will establish a joint biannual assessment/ review of cooperative performance against defined indicators (viability of business plan, communication strategies between cooperative leadership and members, cooperative management). This will help to tailor interventions to cooperative Operations' needs. RCA will be invited to join in capacitating the cooperative to be more transparent, improve its governance, management, and operations	UNHCR Huye FO with support of Gatsibo District Authority and the multistakeholder's coordination committee	<ul> <li>Livelihood staff at Huye FO to initiate cooperative bi-annual performance assessment/ review against established cooperative performance indicators and initiate the joint coordination meetings.</li> <li>During the Icyekerezo Cooperative Quarterly Coordination Meetings chaired by the District, UNHCR Huye FO shall be pro-active and engage other stakeholders (District, RAB and RCA) for joint intervention to capacitate cooperative.</li> <li>LH Staff at Huye FO to follow-up with the cooperative leadership to make sure that all recommendations from assessment are implemented satisfactorily.</li> </ul>	31/08/ 2023		
RECC	DMMENDATION 2:	Iinkages.  Recommended actions:  Specifically, it is recommended as the market option levels are also idented in the image of the image. It is recommended processing buyers the soybean and bean to the interest of the image.	ommended that, as the cooperative is establins for milled maize are explored, alternative ified. that project staff increase diversification of for all value chains supported by the project value chains). The successful linkage to AIF for scale in the bean and soybean value chain.	shing a maize millin buyers for raw mai market linkages by tt moving forward or maize sales coul	ng plant to sell proce terials (corn on cob) videntifying market (in this iteration th d be utilized as an e	essed maize flour, at regional/local options for post is would include example to other

		scale regional/local  • It is recommended	market linkages, through identification of add buyer options. I that this process be undertaken in partners cess. Ultimately, cooperative management wi	hip with the cooper	ative as part of th	ne recommended
Mar	nagement response:	□Agree X □ Partially a	agree Disagree			
Reas	sons (if partially agree or disagree):					
Unit	or function responsible:	UNHCR Huye Field Office				
Тор	-line planned actions	By whom	Comments	Expected completion date	Prog Status	ress Comments
1	The establishment of a maize milling plant to sell processed maize flour was implemented and the testing phase finalised. The production phase is planned within the first quarter of year 2023	Icyekerezo Cooperative with the support from GIZ, as the donor partner that funded the milling plant, UNHCR Huye FO, and Gisagara District		31/05/ 2023 (the production phase to start)		
2	Establishment of cooperative marketing committee.	Icyekerezo Cooperative with the support from UNHCR Huye FO, Gisagara District, and potential partners involved in the Misizi project such as GIZ	a/ LH Staff at Huye FO shall (i) support the establishment of a cooperative marketing committee by connecting the Cooperative to institutions/partners that offer marketing services to Cooperatives for the sustainability of the marketing activity  b/ LH Staff at Huye FO will ensure that primary training on marketing strategies to support cooperative in marketing and market research efforts are conducted	31/08/2023		
3	Misizi Cooperative to become a member of the Private Sector Federation ( PSF ) Agriculture cluster at the district level. This will allow the cooperative to	UNHCR Huye FO, jointly with Gatsibo District will support Misizi Cooperative to join the Federation		31/12/2023		

establish a network with potential buyers and expand its market linkages in the future  Subject to availability of funding, a prospective market assessment mission in selected locations will be conducted to allow the Cooperative establish contracts with big buyers (e.g AIF, SOSOMA, etc. for supplying beans and soja), and potential small buyers (such as high schools, detention facilities, etc. to supply (i) maize flour and (ii) beans for direct consumption)	UNHCR Huye FO with support from Gatsibo district and potential partners	Additionally, LH Staff at Huye FO, in collaboration with the cooperative leadership shall approach big flour processing companies such as AIF and SOSOMA to negotiate forward contracts for supplying soja beans (before the harvest when it will be a soja-planting season.	31/08/2023		
RECOMMENDATION 3:	identify whether ongoing suprovide this support.  Recommended actions:  Specifically, it is replanning meeting is further unpack the It is recommended	commended that project staff utilize currents already being organized) with implementing implication of risks identified by the evaluation that this planning process and its results show the necessary. This process and its results show the evaluation of risks identification of risks identified by the evaluation of risks includes identificated and results show the results of the resul	and – if so – what the street continuation plan g partners (WFP, FA on.	nning efforts (noting AO, MINEMA, GISAO	g a continuation GARA District) to ce needs for
Management response:	■ Agree x ■ Partially a	ngree Disagree			
Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):					
Unit or function responsible:	UNHCR Huye Field Office			_	
Top-line planned actions	By whom	Comments	Expected completion	Prog	
	- ,		date	Status	Comments

1	A multi-stakeholder planning meeting will be organized to agree on an arrangement plan of future support to the Cooperative and secure commitment from stakeholders to take part in the first steps of the planning process	UNHCR Huye FO with support from Gatsibo District and Icyekerezo Cooperative  The support from GIZ will be highly sought as they are already actively involved in the process	<ul> <li>LH Huye FO shall be pro-active in inviting all relevant stakeholders in the meeting</li> <li>LH Huye FO shall bring on the agenda the reflection on needed further support for the cooperative</li> <li>UNHCR BOK with partners to engage partners and mobilize resource to support cooperative unmet identified needs.</li> </ul>	31/08/2023		
RECO	OMMENDATION 4:	members, UN partners and ongoing cooperative develor.  Recommended actions:  Specifically, it is recommended to based cooperative of the based coo	other partners (AIF, KCB Bank, etc.), local government.  commended that the lessons learned and resudecision making moving forward.  to include cooperative members, UN partners ints to encourage transparency of results and	ults from this evaluates WFP, FAO, private	AAA and Misizi partic ation are shared to be partners, NGOs, lo	ipants to inform
Man	agement response:	■Agree X □ Partially a	agree Disagree			
Reas	sons (if partially agree or disagree):					
Unit	or function responsible:	UNHCR BOK, and Huye FO		F	D	
Тор-	line planned actions	By whom	Comments	Expected completion date	Prog Status	Comments
1	a/ A dissemination workshop will be organized at UNHCR regional bureau targeting UNHCR technical staff involved in programme, livelihoods and economic inclusion, as well as partnership development	a/ UNHCR Regional Bureau (Livelihoods and Evaluation Units) with the support of UNHCR Rwanda		11/10/2022	The dissemination workshop at UNHCR RB level was conducted on the 11 <sup>th</sup> October 2022	

	<ul> <li>b/ A Dissemination workshop will be organized at UNHCR targeting all relevant stakeholders who contributed to the Misizi project in various ways.</li> <li>c/ Development of communication materials highlighting key lessons learnt to share with stakeholders</li> </ul>	c/ Monitoring & Evaluation Officer with UNHCR External Relations Unit.	<b>b/</b> LH BOK staff to organize a dissemination meeting bringing together key stakeholders to disseminate the findings and recommendations of the evaluation.	1/10/2022	The dissemination workshop at UNHCR country level was conducted on the 12 <sup>th</sup> October 2022  The communication materials were developed and utilized during dissemination activities.	
2	A dissemination workshop of the findings will be organized at the field level and will include relevant stakeholders who contributed to the Misizi project in various ways, mainly focusing on the implementation modalities of the recommendations	UNHCR Huye FO with the support from UNHCR BOK	c/ LH BOK Staff and LH Huye FO Staff to use different channels of communication to disseminate the communication materials highlighting key lesson learnt during the IKEA F- funded Misizi project	31/03/2023	1) The dissemination meeting with the beneficiaries of the project was conducted on the 23 <sup>rd</sup> March 2023	

	I		gic: Draw on lessons from this proof-of-conc ets to measure the scaling progress and succ		te an approach fo	r scaling, including
		Recommended actions:				
RECC	<ul> <li>Specifically, it is recommended that the project identify learning from this evaluation and its current practices in resolving remaining challenges around irrigation and strengthening market linkages.</li> <li>It is recommended that metrics be standardized across scaled initiatives and cover both process and progress resul and key performance indicators, to track the effectiveness of UNHCR scaling activities in addition to the operationa results. Realistic targets should be set per-project, based on baseline data collection and feasible expectations of expected project achievement, keeping in mind the available resources, including staffing, time, and funding.</li> <li>It is recommended that this take place through a collaborative process between Misizi implementers, UNHCR Region Bureau Monitoring Unit (in collaboration with the Livelihoods Unit) to identify which of the project components, be on lessons and results from this proof-of-concept project are appropriate for scaling, how scaling will take place, and which metrics for ongoing monitoring will be utilized across scaled initiatives.</li> </ul>				progress results ne operational ectations of unding. UNHCR Regional mponents, based	
Man	agement response:	<ul><li>Agree X  X Partially agree</li><li>1) Agree subject to availabilifunds and/or human resource</li></ul>	<ul> <li>Disagree</li> <li>ty of resources (funds and human resources)</li> <li>ces to be implemented.</li> </ul>	for the component	ts of recommendat	tions that require
			oods Unit will also seek expertise from the UN etrics in scaling-up agriculture projects if othe			-
Reas	sons (if partially agree or disagree):	LINUICE Division de Divissor et la	Kigali (BOK) – Livelihoods Unit			
Unit	or function responsible:	ONNER RWallda Bulleau Ol P	rigali (BOK) – Livelinoods Onit			
Ton	-line planned actions	By whom	Comments	Expected completion	Progress	
юр	-inie pianneu actions			date	Status	Comments
1	For "the irrigation component" of the recommendation, organize a stakeholders' sectoral consultation meeting that would come up with clear	UNHCR BOK (Livelihoods and M&E) with the support from the Procurement unit, the	UNHCR BOK will reach out and actively engage other UN specialized UN agencies (WFP, FAO, etc.); Government bodies (such as the Ministry of Agriculture, Rwanda Agriculture Board); specialized	31/12/2023		

	guidelines/mechanisms on how to implement the irrigation component of any agriculture livelihoods project commissioned by UNHCR Rwanda, MINEMA and/or partners	Shelter Unit, the WASH unit, Huye FO & other field offices with current agricultural projects, i.e Kabarore FO), and UNHCR Regional Bureau (Jointly Livelihoods; M&E and Programme Units)	agriculture organizations in Rwanda (eg. One Acre Fund, USAID), partners in agriculture livelihoods projects; local authorities of Gisagara, Gatsibo, Nyamagabe districts; private sector companies and expert consultancy firms.		
2	Regarding "strengthening market linkages", UNHCR BOK jointly with MINEMA will establish a partnership with the Private Sector Federation (PSF) through an MOU, focusing mainly on the "Cluster of Agriculture" that represents businesses in the agribusiness sector with the objective of promoting hosts-refugees projects' integration in their value chains.  The partnership will be trickled down to FO through the respective PSF local representations in the districts that host refugees	UNHCR BOK (Livelihoods Unit), MINEMA, UNHCR FO, Concerned district authorities and cooperatives	Once the MoU signed and established, the respective cooperatives will be expected to work with businesses members of the PSF, to establish stronger market linkages	31/12/2023 (signature of the MOU with PSF)	
3	a/ To establish "standardised metrics across scaled initiatives and cover both process and progress results and key performance indicators, to track the effectiveness of UNHCR	UNHCR BOK (Livelihoods Unit) with the support from UNHCR RB ( Livelihoods Unit)		No-time limit as agriculture projects proposals are designed and	

RECOMMENDATION 6:	project activities  Recommended actions:  • Specifically, it is recomply the agricul capital, income, and  • It is recommended	commended that the partnership approach is continue utilizing tural production model including land prepared food access  that the UN and Government partnership actinue to work closely with the Government of	ontinued and streng ation and market lii approach be continu	gthened in all activit nkages towards stre ued and grown. UN	ies going forward engthening social IHCR as the lead
Further, continue to involve the relevant stakeholders from the design phase, development, implementation, and monitoring of such projects					
UNHCR Rwanda BOK Livelihoods Unit will further seek expertise from the UNHCR RB Livelihoods Unit and Monitoring Units to guide on the standardization of metrics in scaling-up agriculture projects if other agriculture projects proposals are elaborated in 2023					
scaling projects", strengthen and sustain the on-going standardisation of metrics and results frameworks of all operational and implementing partners in agriculture through the regular work of projects monitoring.			implemented in the Operation		

		agricultural liveliho forward, this partn	an mobilize refugee and host community mods project was also made possible by the ership can be reviewed on a regular basis, i.e omparative strengths of UN partners in the Ry	UN partnership appers., as part of annual l	proach with WF	P and FAO. Going
Man	agement response:	■Agree X □ Partially a	ngree Disagree			
Reas	sons (if partially agree or disagree):					
Unit	or function responsible:	UNHCR Rwanda BOK and Fi	eld offices with agricultural projects (e.g., Hu	uye and Kabarore)		
		_		Expected	Pro	gress
Тор-	line planned actions	By whom	Comments	completion date	Status	Comments
1	a/ For on-going agricultural projects, strengthen the existing multi-stakeholders' coordination committee in charge of overseeing projects management and monitoring by agreeing and establishing an official calendar of regular coordination meetings to assess projects cycle and progress (even after projects' closure to ensure the sustainability of projects' gains)  b/ For partnership development, activities to grow and strengthen the UN and Government partnership approach are ongoing	a/ UNHCR FOs offices with agricultural projects, with the support from UNHCR BoK and Districts Local Authorities  b/ UNHCR Rwanda Country Operation at all levels	UNHCR Huye and Kabarore FOs to strengthen the multi-stakeholders' coordination meetings for Misizi, Musishito and Nyabicwamba agricultural projects bringing together the hosting districts, UNHCR, WFP, FAO, RAB, etc., and other stakeholders and championing for the establishment of plan of action and setting short-, medium-, and long-term targets.	<b>a/</b> 30/6/2023 <b>b/</b> No time limit		
REC	OMMENDATION 7:	Recommendation 7 – Strat value chains and support to	egic: UNHCR Rwanda should consolidate po agricultural seasons.	roject model to iden	tify the preferre	ed combination of

		Recommended actions:					
		<ul> <li>Specifically, it is recommended that the project design consider consolidating the project model support to implement a feasible configuration of value chains and growing seasons. The evaluation finds that consistent implementation of two, rather than three planting seasons per year was an effective use of available resources due to complex climate, procurement, and implementation timeline efficiency related issues. It is recommended that two maximum farming seasons, or, depending on available funding, focus on maize production in Season A only, to ensure sowing and harvesting timing can be optimized in alignment with the agricultural production period, without causing delays or skipped implementation for following seasons.</li> <li>It is recommended that the optimal package of project support for agricultural production consider the following elements: market viability (based on market assessment data), farmer preferences for sale and home consumption, feasibility of supporting multiple agricultural seasons within one calendar year, capacity of farmers, implementers, and technical partners.</li> </ul>					
Man	agement response:	"Agree X " X Partially agree "Disagree  The above recommendation was already being implemented in the two agricultural projects led by UNHCR Rwanda, i.e the Misizi Joint Agricultural Project, and the Climate Smart Agriculture project- Mushishito and Nyabicwamba Marshlands.  The planned actions would mainly focus on strengthening the above recommendation					
Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):							
Unit or function responsible:		UNHCR Rwanda Country Ope	eration, and UNHCR Field offices implementing	g agricultural projects			
				Expected	Prog	ress	
Тор-	line planned actions	By whom	Comments	completion date	Status	Comments	
1	a/ Feasibility studies (market assessments, crops combination identification, etc.) to identify the most viable and impactful value chains combination are already being conducted in the design	UNHCR BOK (Livelihoods Unit) with the support from UNHCR FOs offices with agricultural projects, the District local authorities and RAB	a/ Conducting feasibility studies require funds, and thus this planned action is subject to availability of funds within the projects	a/ No time limit ( on-going, and applicable to new projects in the Livelihoods programme)			

	phase of UNHCR Rwanda agricultural projects and their findings incorporated in the project design and implementation. The immediate planned action should be "to sustain that approach in future programming and make sure to include such preliminary studies"  b/ Agriculture projects in Rwanda are embedded in the national agricultural strategic framework, and thus the multistakeholders joint work within the multi-stakeholders' coordination committee platform should be prioritized, strengthened for such technical decision making	(Rwanda Agriculture Board)	<b>b/</b> The planned action is on-going through regular Stakeholders' committee consultation and joint decisions	<b>b/</b> No time limit ( on-going)		
RECO	OMMENDATION 8:	Specifically, it is reconstructed issues such as unrepersonnel. Investment monitoring practice     It is recommended the review and guidents.	ommended that UNHCR sufficiently resource reliable baseline activities, incomplete mornent in methodologically sound evaluations for project staff are recommended. that the regional bureau (Livelihoods, Monit dance on project monitoring plans and targe and project monitoring staff leads should bed.	its monitoring, eval litoring systems ar s, dedicated monit oring Units) plays a t setting. Direct link	uation and learning of understaffing of toring personnel, a larger and more mages between exist	systems to avoid dedicated MEL and trainings on eaningful role in ting regional and

		country office work	e recommendations, it is recommended that ing with regional and HQ colleagues to develo le MEAL systems and process strengthening to	p multi-year funding o			
Man	agement response:		gree Disagree  bility of resources (funds and human resour hisms at UNHCR Rwanda Country Operation le		maintain the nas	cent M&E system	
Reas	ons (if partially agree or disagree):						
Unit	or function responsible:	UNHCR Rwanda Country Operation					
Top-line planned actions		By whom	Comments	Expected completion date	Status	gress Comments	
1	Establish a Monitoring position in UNHCR Country Operation to operationalize Results Based Management (RBM) and sustain the M&E systems and process within the Country Operation Programme, as well as standardizing and consolidating monitoring systems with partners  The Livelihoods and Economic Inclusion programme will also be supported through the above mechanism	UNHCR Rwanda Country Operation		31/12/2023 ( for the establishment of the regular Programme Monitoring position)			
2	Organize exchange meetings that will include the Regional Bureau (Livelihoods, Monitoring and Evaluation units) together with	UNHCR Rwanda Executive Management and Regional Bureau	Though the Misizi Project did not benefit from M&E financial and human resources, UNHCR Rwanda Development and Livelihoods Units have since moved	31/12/2023			

Top-line planned actions	By whom	Comments	completion	Status	Comments	
			Expected	Prog	ress	
Unit or function responsible:	UNHCR Rwanda Country Ope	eration				
Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):						
Management response:	<ol> <li>Agree under the condition that UNHCR Rwanda is the implementing institution of the agriculture project, which should progressively reduce since UNHCR focuses on implementing proof-of-concept projects, and mobilise partners to implement projects while UNHCR Rwanda plays a facilitation and coordination role</li> <li>In case UNHCR implements agriculture projects directly, the above recommendation would be subject to availability of resources (funds and human resources) to implement the component of the recommendation that requires resources</li> </ol>					
RECOMMENDATION 9:	Recommendation 9 - Strategic: UNHCR Rwanda should increase program-level investment in technical capacity.  Suggested Actions  Specifically, it is recommended that UNHCR increase investment in internal technical expertise of implementing staff to have an amplifier effect on results as livelihoods programs reach scale. Although the partnership model has proven effective, investments in internal technical capacity are needed to fulfil UNHCR's role in such programs moving forward. For example, the expansion into the livestock component relied on technical expertise from service providers as no implementing staff or partners had technical expertise in livestock rearing and management practices and could not provide direct technical support to participants.  It is also recommended that UNHCR strengthen existing linkages with technical experts in FAO and WFP to ensure existing technical experts are fully integrated into activity design and implementation.					
Management and Programme to establish a consensus on the implementation roadmap of Monitoring & Evaluation system and process in the Livelihoods Unit		forward and have started the establishment of M&E systems and processes notably through the integration of an M&E Officer Consultant. Challenges remain on funding such structures within the current budget constraints				

1	If UNHCR Rwanda is implementing an agriculture project, positions of agriculture and livestock expertise would be planned, budgeted for, and established in the respective office	UNHCR Rwanda Country Operation	In some instances, due to budget constraints, the position of "livestock expert" was not established and this has caused the lower achievement of results in regard to the Livestock component	No time limit (depend on incoming agriculture projects)	
2	Conditional upon funding and staffing availability, UNHCR Rwanda to increase investment in internal technical capacity of the Livelihoods staff in all field offices by establishing Field Livelihoods Associates in all the field offices.	UNHCR Rwanda Country Operation	The Field Livelihoods Associates would ideally have an agronomist profile as an added competency /skills that allow them to follow-up on agriculture and livestock projects implemented by partners	31/12/2024	
3	a/ UNHCR Rwanda to strengthen technical partnerships with UN Agencies and NGOs involved in Agriculture and livestock, by signing national partnership MoUs (eg FAO, IFAD, One Acre Fund)  b/ Through the Livelihoods Sector Working Group, UNHCR Rwanda will organize a meeting with potential partners in agriculture livelihoods to disseminate the learnings on implementing agriculture projects in the refugee context in Rwanda (i.e increasing partners' technical capacity)	a/ UNHCR Rwanda Country Operation with the support from UNHCR Livelihoods Unit and MINEMA  b/ UNHCR Livelihoods Unit and MINEMA		a/ 31/12/2023 ( a national MoU will be signed with FAO Rwanda) b/ 31/12/2023	