#### Refugee Protection in International Law UNHCR's Global Consultations on International Protection

Millions of people are today forced to flee their homes as a result of conflict, systematic discrimination, or other forms of persecution. The core instruments on which they must rely to secure international protection are the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees and its 1967 Protocol. This book examines key challenges the Convention faces, including the scope of the principle of nonrefoulement and the proper application of the elements of the refugee definition. The Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) commissioned papers on these issues from some of the world's pre-eminent international refugee experts, and these were discussed at a series of expert roundtable meetings during 2001 as part of UNHCR's Global Consultations on International Protection. The papers and roundtable conclusions are published here, together with an overview and the landmark declaration of the 2001 Ministerial Meeting of States Parties to the Convention and/or Protocol.

ERIKA FELLER is the Director of the Department of International Protection with the Office of the UNHCR.

VOLKER TÜRK is Chief of the Protection Policy and Legal Advice Section of UNHCR's Department of International Protection in Geneva.

FRANCES NICHOLSON is a research and editorial consultant on refugee protection and human rights issues with UNHCR.

## Refugee Protection in International Law

UNHCR's Global Consultations on International Protection

edited by ERIKA FELLER VOLKER TÜRK and FRANCES NICHOLSON



PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

 $\odot$  2003 UNHCR. All worldwide rights reserved.

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Lexicon 1 A 9/12.5 pt. System  $L^{A}T_{E}X 2_{\varepsilon}$  [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

ISBN 0521825741 hardback ISBN 0521532817 paperback

## Contents

List of annexes page viii Notes on contributors and editors ix Foreword xv Preface xvii Acknowledgments xx Expert roundtables and topics under the 'second track' of the Global Consultations xxi Table of cases xxii Table of treaties and other international instruments xlv List of abbreviations lv

#### Part 1 Introduction

- 1.1 Refugee protection in international law: an overall perspective 3
   VOLKER TÜRK AND FRANCES NICHOLSON
- 1.2 Age and gender dimensions in international refugee law 46 ALICE EDWARDS
- 1.3 Declaration of States Parties to the 1951 Convention and/or its
   1967 Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees 81

#### Part 2 Non-refoulement (Article 33 of the 1951 Convention)

- 2.1 The scope and content of the principle of *non-refoulement*:
   Opinion 87
   SIR ELIHU LAUTERPACHT QC AND DANIEL BETHLEHEM
- 2.2 Summary Conclusions: the principle of *non-refoulement*, expert roundtable, Cambridge, July 2001 178
- 2.3 List of participants 180

#### Part 3 Illegal entry (Article 31)

- Article 31 of the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees: non-penalization, detention, and protection 185
   GUY S. GOODWIN-GILL
- 3.2 Summary Conclusions: Article 31 of the 1951 Convention, expert roundtable, Geneva, November 2001 253
- 3.3 List of participants 259

#### Part 4 Membership of a particular social group (Article 1A(2))

- 4.1 Protected characteristics and social perceptions: an analysis of the meaning of 'membership of a particular social group' 263
   T. ALEXANDER ALEINIKOFF
- 4.2 Summary Conclusions: membership of a particular social group, expert roundtable, San Remo, September 2001 312
- 4.3 List of participants 314

#### Part 5 Gender-related persecution (Article 1A(2))

- 5.1 Gender-related persecution 319 RODGER HAINES QC
- 5.2 Summary Conclusions: gender-related persecution, expert roundtable, San Remo, September 2001 351
- 5.3 List of participants 353

#### Part 6 Internal protection/relocation/flight alternative

- 6.1 Internal protection/relocation/flight alternative as an aspect of refugee status determination 357
   JAMES C. HATHAWAY AND MICHELLE FOSTER
- 6.2 Summary Conclusions: internal protection/relocation/flight alternative, expert roundtable, San Remo, September 2001 418
- 6.3 List of participants 420

#### Part 7 Exclusion (Article 1F)

7.1 Current issues in the application of the exclusion clauses 425 GEOFF GILBERT Contents

- 7.2 Summary Conclusions: exclusion from refugee status, expert roundtable, Lisbon, May 2001 479
- 7.3 List of participants 486

#### Part 8 Cessation (Article 1C)

- 8.1 Cessation of refugee protection 491 JOAN FITZPATRICK AND RAFAEL BONOAN
- 8.2 Summary Conclusions: cessation of refugee status, expert roundtable, Lisbon, May 2001 545
- 8.3 List of participants 551

#### Part 9 Family unity (Final Act, 1951 UN Conference)

- 9.1 Family unity and refugee protection 555 KATE JASTRAM AND KATHLEEN NEWLAND
- 9.2 Summary Conclusions: family unity, expert roundtable, Geneva, November 2001 604
- 9.3 List of participants 609

#### Part 10 Supervisory responsibility (Article 35)

- 10.1 Supervising the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees: Article 35 and beyond 613
   WALTER KÄLIN
- 10.2 Summary Conclusions: supervisory responsibility, expert roundtable, Cambridge, July 2001 667
- 10.3 List of participants 672

Index 674

#### Annexes

- 2.1 Status of ratifications of key international instruments which include a *non-refoulement* component *page* 164
- 2.2 Constitutional and legislative provisions importing the principle of *non-refoulement* into municipal law 171
- 3.1 Incorporation of Article 31 of the 1951 Convention into municipal law: selected legislation 234

## Notes on contributors and editors

#### T. Alexander Aleinikoff

T. Alexander Aleinikoff is a Professor at the Georgetown University Law Center and a Senior Policy Analyst at the Migration Policy Institute in Washington, DC. A specialist in immigration, refugee, and citizenship law, he has published numerous articles in these fields in US and international journals. From 1994 to 1997, he held positions at the US Immigration and Naturalization Service, first as General Counsel and then as Executive Associate Commissioner for Programs. He is co-author (with David A. Martin and Hiroshi Motomura) of *Immigration and Citizenship: Process and Policy* (4th edn, West Publishing Co., St Paul, MN, 1998).

#### Daniel Bethlehem

Daniel Bethlehem was called to the Bar in 1988, practising in international law from chambers at 20 Essex Street, London. He was a lecturer in international law at the London School of Economics from 1992 to 1998. In 1998, he took up the post of Deputy Director of the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law and a fellowship of Clare Hall at the University of Cambridge. He appears regularly as counsel before the International Court of Justice and other international and domestic tribunals.

#### Rafael Bonoan

Rafael Bonoan is a research staff member with the Institute for Defense Analyses (IDA) in Washington, DC, and a doctoral candidate in the Department of Political Science at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. His primary fields of research are international relations, security studies, and US foreign policy. Prior to coming to the IDA, Bonoan taught international relations as a visiting lecturer at Ateneo de Manila University in the Philippines and worked as a consultant for the GrantCraft Project of the Ford Foundation.

#### Alice Edwards

Alice Edwards is an international refugee and human rights lawyer. She worked as a consultant in UNHCR's Department of International Protection, serving as the focal point on the 'second track' of the Global Consultations on International Protection from July 2001 to July 2002. From 1998 until then, she was a protection officer with UNHCR in Bosnia and Herzegovina and in Rwanda. In 1997, she served as Communications Officer for Food for the Hungry International in Mozambique and in 1998 qualified as a lawyer in Melbourne, Australia. In 1996, she assisted with the editing of the proceedings of a UNHCR symposium on gender-based persecution, which were published in a special issue of the *International Journal of Refugee Law* in 1997. While in Bosnia and Herzegovina, she researched and wrote a major background study published by UNHCR entitled *Daunting Prospects - Minority Women: Obstacles to their Return and Integration* (April 2000).

#### Erika Feller

Erika Feller is currently the Director of the Department of International Protection with the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees in Geneva. A constant thread running through her professional experience has been her work in and with international law, both in its theory, including its drafting, and in its practice. She has, in addition, a solid background in human rights work. Before taking up her first assignment with UNHCR as Senior Legal Adviser in the Office of the Director, Division of Refugee Law and Doctrine, she served for fourteen years as a diplomat with the Australian Foreign Service, both in Canberra and in Berlin, Rome, and Geneva. Since joining UNHCR, she has served in Geneva and in the field as the UNHCR Representative for Malaysia, Brunei, and Singapore.

#### Joan Fitzpatrick

Joan Fitzpatrick is Jeffrey & Susan Brotman Professor of Law at the University of Washington in Seattle. She is the author of six books, including *Human Rights in Crisis: The International System for Protecting Rights During States of Emergency* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 1994), and editor of *Human Rights Protection for Refugees, Asylum-Seekers, and Internally Displaced Persons: A Guide to International Mechanisms and Procedures* (Transnational Publishers, Ardsley, NY, 2002). She is a member of the Board of Editors of the *American Journal of International Law*.

#### Michelle Foster

Michelle Foster is currently a candidate for the degree of SJD at the University of Michigan. She is a graduate of the University of New South Wales, and has held a number of legal positions in Australia, including with the Commonwealth Attorney-General's Department, the New South Wales Attorney-General's Department, and the University of New South Wales.

#### **Geoff Gilbert**

Geoff Gilbert is Professor of Law at the University of Essex, United Kingdom. He is Head of the Department of Law and Director of the LLM in international human rights law. He was part of the University of Essex Human Rights Centre research programme on human rights in situations of acute crisis that was carried out on behalf of the UK Department for International Development. He has carried out human rights training on behalf of the Council of Europe and UNHCR in the Russian Federation (Siberia and Kalmykskaya), Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, and Kosovo. He has acted as an expert consultant on refugees and terrorism for UNHCR and since 2002 has been Editorin-Chief of the *International Journal of Refugee Law*. His specialisms are international human rights law, the protection of refugees in international law, and international criminal law.

#### Guy S. Goodwin-Gill

Guy S. Goodwin-Gill is Professor of International Refugee Law and Rubin Director of Research, Institute of European Studies, University of Oxford, United Kingdom. Since October 2002, he has been a Senior Research Fellow at All Souls College, Oxford. In 1994–2000, he was also Professor of Asylum Law, University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands. He served with UNHCR, principally as a Legal Adviser, from 1976 to 1988, since when he has been engaged in teaching, research, and the provision of advice on international law and refugee and migration-related issues. He is the Founding Editor of the *International Journal of Refugee Law* and was Editor-in-Chief in 1989–2001. Among his publications are *The Refugee in International Law* (2nd edn, Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1996) and *The Reality of International Law: Essays in Honour of Ian Brownlie* (Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1999), the latter as co-editor and contributor. Since 1997, he has been President of the Refugee Legal Centre (a UK non-governmental organization providing advice and representation to refugees and asylum seekers) and, since 2000, the UN-appointed President of the Media Appeals Board of Kosovo. He is a Member of the Bar of England and Wales.

#### **Rodger Haines QC**

Rodger Haines QC was appointed to the New Zealand Refugee Status Appeals Authority when it was constituted in 1991 and has written many of the Authority's principal decisions. He is currently Deputy Chairperson of the Authority. Since 1993, he has lectured in immigration and refugee law at the Faculty of Law, Auckland University, New Zealand.

#### James C. Hathaway

James C. Hathaway is Professor of Law at the University of Michigan, United States, and is the founding director of the University's Program in Refugee and Asylum Law, in which students have the opportunity to study refugee law from international, comparative, and interdisciplinary perspectives. He is also Senior Visiting Research Associate at the Refugee Studies Centre at the University of Oxford, United Kingdom. He was previously Professor of Law and Associate Dean of the Osgoode Hall Law School, Toronto, Canada, and has been a visiting professor at the Universities of Tokyo and California. His publications include *The Law of Refugee Status* (Butterworths, Toronto, 1991), editorship of *Reconceiving International Refugee Law* (Martinus Nijhoff, The Hague, 1997), and more than forty journal articles. He is on the editorial boards of the *Journal of Refugee Studies* and the *Immigration and Nationality Law Reports*, and directs the Refugee Caselaw Site, a website that collects, indexes, and publishes selected recent court decisions on refugee law. He has recently been appointed to direct the first advanced course on refugee law for the International Association of Refugee Law Judges and is completing work on his next book, *The Rights of Refugees under International Law*.

#### Kate Jastram

Kate Jastram is an Acting Clinical Professor at Boalt Hall School of Law, University of California at Berkeley, United States. She is currently on a leave of absence from UNHCR, where she has served in a variety of positions in Geneva, including as Senior Human Rights Liaison Officer, and as Deputy Regional Representative for the United States and the Caribbean. Prior to joining UNHCR, she was Director of the Refugee and Asylum Project of the Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights and was an attorney in private practice in San Francisco, specializing in immigration and nationality law. She has served as a consultant to the Migration Policy Institute, the Institute of International Law and Economic Development, and the International Migration Policy Program of the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace. She is the author, co-author or editor of a number of monographs and training and resource materials on refugee and human rights law.

#### Walter Kälin

Walter Kälin, is Professor of Constitutional and International Law at the Faculty of Law of the University of Bern, Switzerland. Dr Kälin's books include studies on the principle of *non-refoulement* (1982), the Swiss asylum law (1990), issues of fundamental rights in multicultural societies (2000), and annotations to the Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement (2000). He was Special Rapporteur of the UN Commission on Human Rights on the Situation of Human Rights in Kuwait under Iraqi Occupation (1991–2) and has acted, on many occasions, as a consultant to UNHCR, the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights, the UN Development Programme, and other organizations.

#### Sir Elihu Lauterpacht QC

Elihu Lauterpacht was called to the Bar in 1950, was appointed a QC in 1970, and was knighted in 1996. He practises from chambers at 20 Essex Street, London. He became a Fellow of Trinity College at the University of Cambridge, United Kingdom, in 1953. The founder of the Research Centre for International Law in 1983, he was its first Director until 1995 since when he has been its Emeritus Director.

He was appointed an Honorary Professor of International Law at Cambridge University in 1994. He was Ad Hoc Judge in the *Genocide Case* before the International Court of Justice, sits regularly as an arbitrator in international proceedings, as well as appearing frequently as counsel before both domestic and international tribunals.

#### Kathleen Newland

Kathleen Newland is Co-Director and co-founder of the Migration Policy Institute, a think-tank on international migration and refugee issues established in Washington DC in 2001. Before this, she was a Senior Associate at the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, where she co-directed the International Migration Policy Program. She chairs the Board of Directors of the Women's Commission for Refugee Women and Children, and sits on the Board of the International Rescue Committee. In 1992–3, she wrote the first *State of the World's Refugees* report for UNHCR. From 1988 to 1992, she lectured at the London School of Economics, when she also co-founded and directed Humanities, an educational trust dedicated to increasing awareness of international humanitarian issues. She is the author or editor of five books, eleven shorter monographs, and other publications, and is the executive producer of three documentary films on humanitarian issues.

#### **Frances Nicholson**

Frances Nicholson is a research and editorial consultant on refugee protection and human rights issues. She is co-editor of *Refugee Rights and Realities*: *Evolving International Concepts and Regimes* (Cambridge University Press, 1999) and has worked for UNHCR as editor and analyst on *The State of the World's Refugees 2000* (Oxford University Press, 2000). After completing a masters in International Relations at the University of Cambridge, United Kingdom, she worked as Airey Neave Research Fellow at the Human Rights Law Centre of the University of Nottingham, UK. Recent projects include writing and editing the report *Kosovo/Kosova, As Seen, As Told* for the Office of Democratic Institutions and Human Rights of the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe and the drafting of background papers for UNHCR's Global Consultations on International Protection.

#### Volker Türk

Volker Türk is currently Chief of the Protection Policy and Legal Advice Section of UNHCR's Department of International Protection in Geneva which had particular responsibilities for the Global Consultations process. From 1997 to early 2000, he served as Assistant Chief of Mission (Protection) for the UNHCR operations in Bosnia and Herzegovina and in Kosovo. From 1995 to 1997, he was legal adviser in the Division of International Protection in UNHCR, Geneva; from 1993 to 1995, regional legal adviser for central and eastern Europe (Europe Bureau, UNHCR, Geneva); and from 1991 to 1993, protection officer in the UNHCR office in Kuwait. He has also had brief temporary assignments in central Asia and in the Democratic Republic of Congo. Before that, he worked as a university assistant at the Institute of International Law at the University of Vienna, where he finished his doctoral thesis on UNHCR and its mandate (published in German by Duncker & Humblot, Berlin, 1992). From 1985 to 1988, he was research assistant at the Institute of Criminal Law at the University of Linz, Austria. He has published widely on international refugee law.

#### Foreword

At the start of the twenty-first century, fifty years after the drafting of the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees, international refugee protection is at a crossroads. In a globalizing world and a rapidly changing political environment, the Convention faces many challenges. These include new forms of persecution and conflict, complex mixed migration movements, the reluctance of many states to accept refugees, and restrictive interpretation of the Convention.

The papers and the conclusions contained in this volume are one outcome of the Global Consultations on International Protection, organized by UNHCR in 2000–2 to reinvigorate the international refugee protection regime. They address key questions relating to the 1951 Convention, where it was considered that greater clarity and coherence of interpretation was needed. They are the result of a series of expert roundtables which were held in 2001 as part of the Global Consultations.

This book examines some of the legal issues that are part of the system of governance for refugees. The cornerstone of this system remains the 1951 Convention and its 1967 Protocol. The aim is to ensure that this system can function more effectively, equitably, and efficiently, enabling refugees to obtain the protection to which they are entitled.

Refugee protection problems cannot be addressed in isolation. All stakeholders, whether they be international organizations, governments, judiciaries, civil society, non-governmental organizations, or academia, need to strengthen their partnerships and clarify their roles. Clearer understanding and more consistent implementation are an integral part of ensuring that refugee protection burdens and responsibilities are shared more equally, and that some of the world's most vulnerable individuals are able to find durable solutions to their plight and to enjoy the respect that they deserve.

The Declaration agreed by delegates at the Ministerial Meeting of States Parties to the 1951 Convention and/or 1967 Protocol in December 2001 called on States to 'strengthen asylum and render protection more effective'. I hope this volume will serve as a tool to assist those involved in refugee protection in this endeavour.

Ruud Lubbers United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

#### Preface

The world has changed radically since the establishment of UNHCR and the coming into force of the Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees some fifty years ago. The modern regime of international refugee protection has been built on these beginnings in the aftermath of the Second World War and is now a complex structure affording vital protection to millions of forcibly displaced people. Within this structure, the Convention and its 1967 Protocol are widely acknowledged as enduring instruments with a 'central place in the international refugee protection regime', as States Parties to the Convention and/or Protocol declared in December 2001.

Conclusions have, however, sometimes been drawn which put in question the ongoing relevance of the Convention or which seem to call for its complete overhaul, or even abandonment. Such conclusions are misguided, even dangerous. They contribute to the waning quality of asylum, as State commitment to protection using the available instruments starts to falter. UNHCR does of course recognize that the challenges today are many and various and that there are gaps in the protection framework, even while, at the core, the Convention regime's fundamental principles are as sound and necessary as ever.

The Global Consultations on International Protection have been UNHCR's effort to rise to modern challenges confronting refugee protection, to shore up support for the international framework of protection principles, and to explore the scope for enhancing protection through new approaches, which nevertheless respect the concerns and constraints of States and other actors. The process was designed to promote better understanding of today's protection dilemmas, from the perspective both of the providers and of the beneficiaries of international protection. State interests and refugee needs have not been always easy to reconcile, but certainly the first step in this direction can only be taken when the possibilities and limitations are properly appreciated.

The Consultations were also conceptualized so as to realize better cooperation among all concerned. Best practices, or at least baselines, for making asylum systems work more justly and efficiently, coupled with a firming up of political will to improve the 'doing' of protection, not on an ad hoc and discretionary basis, but more predictably and consistently within the internationally agreed parameters, were likewise an objective. So too was a more reasoned approach to responsibility sharing, in order to rationalize the assumption of responsibilities and balance the burdens in a more equitable manner. Finally, the Consultations had the goal of contributing to improved implementation of important framework principles, including by clarifying their meaning in a modern context.

The various issues raised in the course of the Global Consultations were organized along three 'tracks'. The first culminated in an unprecedented Ministerial Meeting of States Parties to the 1951 Convention and/or 1967 Protocol in Geneva in December 2001. The Declaration from that meeting – the first ever adopted by all States Parties – is reproduced in Part 1.3 of this book. That Declaration stands as an important measure of political commitment to better refugee protection within a strengthened Convention framework. The 'second track' of the Consultations involved a series of expert roundtables held during 2001 on specific issues in the interpretation of the 1951 Convention on which greater clarity is required, as set out in the table on p. xxi. A more harmonized understanding of how the Convention is to be applied in today's world will, it is hoped, be one enduring outcome. The 'third track' brought together States and other actors, within the framework of the Executive Committee of the High Commissioner's Programme, to examine various specific or thematic refugee protection concerns not directly, or not adequately, covered by the Convention and Protocol.

Overall the Global Consultations process has encouraged a cooperative spirit in tackling refugee issues. It has aroused an interest in multilateral dialogue to find solutions to an increasingly internationalized set of problems. The process has confirmed a willingness to pool concerns and jointly point the way forward to the durable resolution of problems whose solution is within our collective reach. Together, UNHCR and States have drafted an Agenda for Protection, which should help both to inform and to shape debate and policy formation. The Agenda comprises a comprehensive programme of action to tackle the various issues besetting refugee protection in today's complex environment.

This book represents a key outcome very particularly of the second track roundtable meetings and the Summary Conclusions resulting from them. It focuses in a detailed manner on discrete legal issues of interpretation of the 1951 Convention, bringing together the expert papers presented to the participants at the roundtable meetings and their conclusions. The authors were asked to make proposals to establish common understandings on key issues of Convention interpretation in order to promote greater consistency in the application of the Convention in the different jurisdictions of the world. They were also asked to factor into their analysis subsequent developments in international law of relevance to forced displacement.

The book is introduced by an overview of refugee protection in international law, followed by a paper on the age- and gender-sensitive interpretation of the 1951 Convention and the text of the 2001 Declaration of the Ministerial Meeting of States Parties to the 1951 Convention and/or 1967 Protocol. The book then comprises nine parts, each containing a paper by different leading international refugee experts on key issues of interpretation of the 1951 Convention. These concern *non-refoulement*, illegal entry, membership of a particular social group, gender-related persecution, internal flight, relocation or protection alternatives, exclusion, cessation, family unity and reunification, and UNHCR's supervisory responsibility under its Statute. Each of these issues was debated at an expert roundtable meeting in 2001 and the Summary Conclusions of those meetings follow the relevant paper.

I trust this book will offer a valuable resource for judges, adjudicators, legal practitioners, government officers, humanitarian workers, non-governmental refugee advocates, and academics alike in their various efforts towards the common goal of strengthening refugee protection worldwide. For its part, UNHCR will be drawing on these various contributions to refine its own guidelines, which it makes available pursuant to its responsibility under paragraph 8 of its Statute and Article 35 of the 1951 Convention itself.

> Erika Feller Director of International Protection Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

#### Acknowledgments

UNHCR would like to thank the co-organizers of the expert roundtables held as part of the 'second track' of the Global Consultations on International Protection for their important substantive and financial contribution in making these events possible. The co-organizers involved were the International Migration Policy Institute of the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, New York, United States; the Luso-American Foundation for Development, Lisbon, Portugal: the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge, United Kingdom; the International Institute of Humanitarian Law, San Remo, Italy; and the Graduate Institute of International Studies, Geneva, Switzerland. Other significant financial contributors to the overall Global Consultations process, who also therefore helped to make these roundtables happen, were Australia, Canada, the European Commission, Japan, Luxembourg, the Netherlands, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland, the United Kingdom, and the United States. In addition, the governments of Canada, China, Costa Rica, Egypt, France, Hungary, Norway, and South Africa each hosted regional meetings in the context of the 'third track' of the Consultations which likewise made an important contribution to the process.

The editors would especially like to thank Kate Jastram and Alice Edwards, who provided valuable substantive and organizational input as consecutive focal points for the second track of the Global Consultations, as well as Eve Lester, the nongovernmental organization (NGO) liaison officer for the Consultations.

In addition, the editors are most grateful for the input and comments of colleagues Nicholas Arons, Alexander Beck, Walter Brill, Walpurga Englbrecht, Diane Goodman, Nathalie Karsenty, Irene Khan, Janice Marshall, Hugh Massey, Sophie Muller, Shahrzad Tadjbakhsh, Mignon van der Liet, and Wilbert van Hövell. Thanks also go to Finola O'Sullivan, Treena Hall, Jennie Rubio, Caro Drake, and Martin Gleeson at Cambridge University Press, as well as Lesley Dingle at the Squire Law Library in Cambridge, for their kind support in seeing this project through to publication.

The publisher has used its best endeavours to ensure that the URLs for external websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will remain appropriate.

# Expert roundtables and topics under the 'second track' of the Global Consultations

Roundtables	Topics
<b>1st Roundtable</b> Date: 3–4 May 2001 Venue: Lisbon Co-organizer: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, Washington DC Hosted by: Fundaão Luso-Americana para o Desenvolvimento	<ul> <li>Cessation (Article 1C)</li> <li>Exclusion (Article 1F)</li> </ul>
2nd Roundtable Date: 9–10 July 2001 Venue: Cambridge Co-organizer: Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, Cambridge, UK	<ul> <li>Principle of <i>non-refoulement</i> (Article 33)</li> <li>Supervisory responsibility (Article 35)</li> </ul>
<b>3rd Roundtable</b> Date: 6–8 September 2001 Venue: San Remo Co-organizer: International Institute of Humanitarian Law, San Remo, Italy	<ul> <li>Membership of a particular social group (Article 1A(2))</li> <li>Gender-related persecution (Article 1A(2))</li> <li>Internal protection/relocation/ flight alternative</li> </ul>
<b>4th Roundtable</b> Date: 8–9 November 2001 Venue: Geneva Co-organizer: Graduate Institute of International Studies, Geneva, Switzerland	<ul> <li>Illegal entry (Article 31)</li> <li>Family unity (Final Act of the 1951 UN Conference)</li> </ul>

## Table of cases

Many of the cases cited in this volume are available on the UNHCR website, www.unhcr.org, and on UNHCR's Refworld CD-ROM, available from the Protection Information Section, Office of the UN High Commissioner for Refugees, Case Postale 2500, CH-1211 Gen`eve 2 D´ep^ot, Switzerland, e-mail HQPR11@ unhcr.org. Other useful websites, all of which are freely accessible, are given below.

#### Permanent Court of International Justice Consistency of

Certain Danzig Legislative Decrees prigh 428000nstitution of the Free City,McServinesnav/us, Ribesting D385essions, Series A, No. 2, 30 Aug. 1924376n

#### **International Court of Justice**

Judgments are available on http://www.icj-cij.org/icjwww/idecisions.htm. Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (Bosnia and Herzegovina v. Yugoslavia), Preliminary Objections, ICJ Reports 1996, p. 595 636n Barcelona Traction, Light and Power Co. Case (Belgium v. Spain), ICJ Reports 1970, p.4 431n East Timor (Portugal v. Australia), ICJ Reports 1995, p. 90 636n Gabcikovo-Nagymaros Project (Hungary/Slovakia), Judgment, ICJ Reports 1997, p.7 105 Interpretation of Peace Treaties with Bulgaria, Hungary and Romania, First Phase, Advisory Opinion, ICJ Reports 1950, p. 65 636n Legal Consequences for States of the Continued Presence of South Africa in Namibia (South West Africa) Notwithstanding Security Council Resolution 276 (1970), Advisory Opinion, ICJ Reports 1971, p. 16 104-5, 113 Military and Paramilitary Activities In and Against Nicaragua (Nicaragua v. United States of *America*), Jurisdiction and Admissibility, Judgment, ICJ Reports 1984, p. 329; and Merits, Judgment, ICJ Reports 1986, p. 14 141, 142, 147, 460n, 473n

North Sea Continental Shelf, Judgment, ICJ Reports 1969, p. 3 142–3, 148 Reservations to the Convention on the Prevention of and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, Advisory Opinion, ICJ Reports 1951, p. 15 104 South West Africa, Second Phase, Judgment, ICJ Reports 1966, p. 6 105 United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran (Tehran Hostages Case), ICJ Reports, 1980, p. 3 152n, 223n

## International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia

Judgments available at http://www.un.org/icty/judgement.htm.

Prosecutor v. Drazen Erdemovic, Judgment, Case No. IT-96-22-A, 7 Oct. 1997 473n
Prosecutor v. Anto Furundzija, ICTY, Case No. IT-95-17/1-T, 10 Dec. 1998 (judgment upheld by Appeals Chamber, 21 July 2000) 53n
Prosecutor v. Kunarac, Kovac, and Vukovic, Case No. IT-96-23 and IT-96-23/1, 22 Feb. 2001 (judgment upheld by Appeals Chamber, 12 June 2002) 49n, 53n, 336n
Prosecutor v. Kupreskic, Case No. IT-95-16-T, 14 Jan. 2000 434n
Prosecutor v. Duško Tadić, Decision on the Defence Motion for Interlocutory Appeal on Jurisdiction before the Appeals Chamber of ICTY, Case No. IT-94-1-AR72, 1995 434n, 435n, 437n, 438n

## International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

Decisions available at http://www.ictr.org/.

```
Prosecutor v. Jean-Paul Akayesu, Case No. ICTR-96-4-T, 2 Sept. 1998 53n, 336n, 445n
```

## Human Rights Committee

Decisions of the Human Rights Committee are available on http://www.unhchr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf/FramePage/TypeJurisprudence?OpenDocument.

- A. v. *Australia*, Communication No. 560/1993, Annual Report 1997, vol. II, UN doc. A/52/40, 3 April 1997 226–7, 629n
- A.R.J. v. *Australia*, Communication No. 692/1996, Annual Report 1997, vol. II, UN doc. A/52/40, 28 July 1997 629n

*de Casariego* v. *Uruguay*, Communication No. 56/1979, UN doc. CCPR/C/13/D/56/1979, 29 July 1981 111n

- *Cox* v. *Canada*, Communication No. 539/1993, UN doc. CCPR/C/52/D/539/1993, 9 Dec. 1994 157n
- G.T. v. *Australia*, Communication No. 706/1996, UN doc. CCPR/C/61/D/706/1996, 4 Dec. 1997 157n, 629n

Joseph Kindler v. Canada, Communication No. 470/1991, Annual Report 1993, vol. II, UN doc. A/48/40, 30 July 1993 629n López Burgos v. Uruguay, Communication No. 52/1979, UN doc. CCPR/C/13/D/52/1979, 29 July 1981 110-11, 160n Chitat Ng v. Canada, Communication No. 469/1991, UN doc. 157-8, 161, 161n, 476n, 629n CCPR/C/49/D/469/1991, 7 Jan. 1994 Toonen v. Australia, Communication No. 488/1992, UN doc. CCPR/C/50/D/488/1992, 4 April 1994 66n Van Duzen v. Canada, Communication No. 50/1979, UN doc. CCPR/C/15/D/50/1979, 7 April 1982 195n Winata and Liv. Australia, Communication No. 930/2000, UN doc. CCPR/C/72/D/930/2000, 16 Aug. 2001 574n

#### **Committee Against Torture**

Decisions of the Committee Against Torture are available on http://www.unhchr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf/FramePage/TypeJurisprudence? OpenDocument.

Alan v. Switzerland, Communication No. 21/1995, 6 May 1996 395n A.L.N. v. Switzerland, Communication No. 90/1997, 19 May 1998 162n Ayas v. Sweden, Communication No. 97/1997, 12 Nov. 1998 477n E.A. v. Switzerland, Communication No. 28/1995, 10 Nov. 1997 162n Elmi v. Australia, Communication No. 120/1998, 14 May 1999 162n G.R.B. v. Sweden, Communication No. 83/1997, 15 May 1998 162n H.D. v. Switzerland, Communication No. 112/1998, 30 April 1999 162n I.A.O. v. Sweden, Communication No. 65/1997, 6 May 1998 162n Khan v. Canada, Communication No. 15/1994, 15 Nov. 1994 162n, 475n, 477n K.N. v. Switzerland, Communication No. 94/1997, 19 May 1998 162n Korban v. Sweden, Communication No. 88/1997, 16 Nov. 1998 162n Mutombo v. Switzerland, Communication No. 13/1993, 27 April 1994 161n, 475n, 628n

 N.P. v. Australia, Communication No. 106/1998, 6 May 1999
 162n

 Paez v. Sweden, Communication No. 39/1996, 28 April 1997
 162n, 477n

 S.M.R. and M.M.R. v. Sweden, Communication No. 103/1998, 5 May 1999
 162n

#### African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights

See http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/africa/comcases/comcases.html and http://www.achpr.org/html/communications.html.

John K. Modise v. Botswana, Communication No. 97/1993, 23 Oct.–6 Nov. 2000 146n, 158

## European Court of Human Rights

Judgments of the European Court of Human Rights are available on http://www.echr.coe.int/. Abdulaziz, Cabales and Balkandali v. United Kingdom, Applications Nos. 9214/80, 9473/81, and 9474/81, 28 May 1985 581n Ahmed v. Austria, Reports of Judgments and Decisions 1996-VI, 27 Nov. 1996 93n, 145, 155n Ahmut v. the Netherlands, Application No. 73/1995/579/665, 28 Nov. 1996 581 Amrollahi v. Denmark, Application No. 56811/00, 11 July 2002 34 Amuur v. France, Reports of Judgments and Decisions 1996-III, 20 May 1996 192-3, 205-6, 220n, 629n Aydin v. Turkey, Case No. 57/1996/676/866, 25 Sept. 1997 53n Berrehab v. The Netherlands, Application No. 10730/84, 21 June 1988 576n Chahal v. United Kingdom, Reports of Judgments and Decisions 1996-V, 25 Oct. 1996 92n, 135n, 145n, 155-6, 159, 161, 162n, 396n, 405, 453n, 461n, 462n, 475n, 476 Cruz Varas v. Sweden, Series A, No. 201, 20 Feb. 1991 92n, 145n Gül v. Switzerland, Application No. 53/1995/559/645, 19 Feb. 1996 581 Hilal v. United Kingdom, Decision No. 45276/99, 6 March 2001 396n Ireland v. United Kingdom, Series A, No. 25, 13 Dec. 1977 153n, 638n Jabari v. Turkey, Application No. 40035/98, 11 July 2000 54n, 465n Labita v. Italy, Application No. 26772/95, 6 April 2000 475n Loizidou v. Turkey (Preliminary Objections), Series A, No. 310, 23 Feb. 1995 111, 159n Maaouia v. France, Application No. 39652/98, 5 Oct. 2000 461n Marckx v. Belgium, Series A, No. 31, 27 April 1979 575n Modinos v. Cyprus, Series A, No. 259, 25 March 1993 21n Moustaquim v. Belgium, Application No. 12313/86, 25 Jan. 1991 576n Selmouni v. France, Application No. 25803/94, 28 July 1999 475n Sen v. The Netherlands, Application No. 31465/96, 21 Dec. 2001 581 Soering v. United Kingdom, Series A, No. 161, 7 July 1989 92n, 144-5, 155, 156, 161, 476n, 629n T.I. v. United Kingdom, Application No. 43844/98, Decision as to Admissibility, 7 March 2000 93n, 122n, 145, 156n, 160, 161, 161n Tyrer v. United Kingdom, Series A, No. 26, 25 April 1978 105n Vilvarajah v. United Kingdom, Series A, No. 215, 26 Sept. 1991 92n, 145n

## European Commission of Human Rights

Judgments of the European Commission of Human Rights are available on http://www.echr.coe.int/.

Agee v. United Kingdom, Application No. 7729/76, 17 Dec. 1976; 7 DR 164, 1977 476n Alla Raidl v. Austria, Application No. 25342/94, 1995 14n Austria v. Italy, 4 Yearbook of the European Convention on Human Rights, 11 Jan. 638n 1961 Aylor Davis v. France, Application No. 22742/93, 76 DR 164, 1994 13n Leong Chong Meng v. Portugal, Application No. 25862/95, 1995 13n X. and Y. v. United Kingdom, Application No. 9369/81, 3 May 1983 576n Y. v. The Netherlands, Application No. 16531/90, 68 DR 299, 1991 13n

## Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

Decisions of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights are available on http://www.cidh.oas.org/DefaultE.htm and on http://www.wcl.american.edu/pub/humright/digest/.

Advisory Opinion on the Effect of Reservations on the Entry into Force of the American<br/>Convention, 24 Sept. 1982, 22 ILM, 1983, p. 47638nRaquel Martín de Mejía v. Peru, Case No. Report No. 5/96, 1 March 199652n

## Australia

Decisions of Australian courts are available on http://www.austlii.edu.au/.

## High Court of Australia

Applicant A. and Another v. Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs and
Another, [1997] 190 CLR 225; 142 ALR 331, 24 Feb. 1997 18n, 43n, 264n,
265n, 271–3, 274, 277n, 280, 286–7, 288n, 290, 293, 295n, 296, 306n, 324n,
345n, 372n, 378n
Chen Shi Hai v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, (2000)
170 ALR 553; [2000] CLR 293, 13 April 2000 43n, 57n, 272, 306n,
373n
Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Ibrahim, [2000] HCA 55, 26 Oct.
2000 59n
${\it MinisterforImmigrationandMulticulturalAffairsv.Khawar,[2000]HCA14,11April}$
2002 39n, 40n, 41n, 53n, 54n, 60, 71, 273n, 321n, 327n, 330n, 332n, 336n,
340n, 342n, 366n, 372n, 373n
Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Daljit Singh, [2002] HCA 7, 7
March 2002 30n

## Federal Court of Australia

Al-Amidi v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, (2000) 177 ALR
506 337n, 378n, 391
Applicant L.S.L.S. v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, [2000] FCA 211, 6 March 2000 55n, 66
Betkoshabeh v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, (1998) 157
ALR 95 450n
Dhayakpa v. Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs, (1995) 62 FCR 556 447n
Islam v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, (2000) 171 ALR
267 379n
Khawar v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, (1999) 168 ALR 190, 5
Nov. 1999 330n
Lay Kon Tji v. Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs, (1998) 158 ALR 681 374,
377n, 408n,
Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Applicant Z., [2001] FCA 1823, 19
Dec. 2001 57n
Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Jama, (Full Court) [1999] FCA
1680, 3 Dec. 1999 382n
Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Jang, (2000) 175
ALR 752 397
Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Khawar, (Full Court) [2000] FCA
1130, 23 Aug. 2000 273n, 303
Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Sarrazola, [1999] FCA
1134 306n
Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Vadarlis, Human Rights and Equal
Opportunity Commission, and Amnesty International, [2001] FCA 1329, 18 Sept.
2001 209n, 230
Omar v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, (Full Court) [2000] FCA
1430 385n
Perampalam v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, (Full Court) (1999) 84
FCR 274 390n, 400n, 411n
Randhawa v. Minister for Immigration, Local Government and Ethnic Affairs,
(Full Court) (1994) 124 ALR 265, 19 May 1994 363n, 365–6, 378n, 390n,
400n
Singh v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, [2000] FCA 1125 449n
Syan v. Refugee Review Tribunal and Another, (1995) 61 FCR 284 370
Wang v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, (Full Court) [2000] FCA
1599 385n
Ye Hong v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, [1998] 1356 FCA,
2 Oct. 1998 385n

#### Refugee Review Tribunal

Decisions can be found at http://www.rrt.gov.au/.

 Decision No. N94/03786, 1995
 390n

 Decision No. V95/03188, 12 Oct. 1995
 66n

 Decision No. V96/04931, 25 Nov. 1996
 394n

 Decision No. V96/04189, 26 Feb. 1997
 413n

 Decision No. V96/05239, 11 March 1997
 388n

 Decision No. V98/08482, 31 March 1999
 370n

#### Austria

The texts of judgments of the Constitutional Court (*Verfassungsgerichtshof*) since 1980 and the Administrative Court (*Verwaltungsgerichtshof*) since 1990 can be found in German at http://www.ris.bka.gv.at/auswahl/.

Oberster Gerichtshof (Supreme Court)

 Hungarian Deserter case (Austria), ÖR 38 (1960) p. 96, 28 ILR 343, 1959
 451n, 469

 Universal Jurisdiction case (Austria), OGH Serie Strafsachen XXIX No. 32, 28 ILR

 341, 1958
 451n, 469

Verwaltungsgerichtshof (Administrative Court)

 Decision No. 95/20/0284, 12 Sept. 1996
 394n

 Decision No. 95/20/0295, 18 April 1996
 415n

 Decision No. 99/20/0497-6, 31 Jan. 2002
 54n, 61n

 Georg K. v. Ministry of the Interior, 71 ILR 284, 1969
 456n

Austrian Independent Federal Asylum Senate

Decision No. IFAS 220. 268/0-XI/33/00, Vienna, 21 March 2002 54n

## Belgium

Cour d'Assises Bruxelles (Court of Assizes Brussels)

Procureur-Général v. Vincent Ntezimana, Alphonse Higaniro, Consolata Mukangango, Julienne Mukabutera, available at http://www.asf.be/AssisesRwanda2/ fr/frStart.htm 427n

## Tribunal civil (Réf.) Bruxelles

D.D. and D.N. v. Etat belge, Ministre de l'intérieur et Ministre de la santé publique, de l'environnment et de l'intégration sociale, 25 Nov. 1993, No. RDDE, No. 76, Nov.–Dec. 1993, p. 604 223n

## Canada

Judgments can be found at http://www.canlii.org/index.en.html.

## Judicial Committee of the Privy Council

Attorney-General of Canada v. Cain, [1906] AC 542 222n

## Supreme Court of Canada

Judgments can be found at http://www.lexum.umontreal.ca/csc-scc/en/ index.html.

Canada (Attorney-General) v. Ward, [1993] 2 SCR 689; (1993) 103 DLR (4th) 1 39n, 59n, 60n, 63n, 68n, 70n, 268–71, 272, 274, 275–6, 280, 286n, 290n, 293, 307, 327n, 332n, 333n, 336n, 345n, 359n, 366n, 372n, 380n, 385n, 446n
Chan v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration), [1995] 3 SCR 593 270n, 293, 306–7n
Pushpanathan v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration), [1998] 1 SCR 982 450n, 451, 455, 456–7
Suresh v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration), 11 Jan. 2002 12, 13n, 30, 443n, 454n, 460n, 463n, 476n, 478n
United States v. Burns, [2001] SCC 7, File No. 26129, 15 Feb. 2001 476n

## Federal Court of Canada

In this listing (TD) refers to the Trial Division and (CA) to the Court of Appeal Division within the Federal Court of Canada.

Ahani v. Canada, [1995] 3 FC 669 (TD) 449n
Ahmed v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration), (1993) FCJ 718 (CA) 384n
An Li v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration, IMM-1023-95 (TD), 30 March 2001 62n

- Annan v. Canada (MCI), [1995] 3 FC 25 (TD), 6 July 1995 54n
- Barrera v. Canada (MEI), [1993] 2 FC 3 (CA); (1992) 99 DLR (4th) 264; 18 Imm LR (2d) 81; 151 NR 28 (CA) 462n
- *Bhambri* v. *Canada* (MCI), Decision No. IMM-649-96, [1996] FCJ No. 1661 (TD), 18 Dec. 1996 412–13
- Brzezinski v. Canada (MCI), [1998] 4 FC 525 (TD) 450n
- Canada (MCI) v. Ranganathan, Decision No. A-348-99, [2001] 2 FC 164 (CA),
  - 21 Dec. 2000 389n
- *Canada* (MCI) v. *Smith*, [1999] 1 FC 310 (TD), [1998] FCJ No. 1613, 29 Oct. 1998 63n
- Castellanos v. Canada (Solicitor-General), 2 FC 190 (TD), 1995 571n
- *Dhaliwal* v. *Canada* (MCI), Decision No. IMM-1200-97 (1997) (TD); 1997 Fed. Ct. Trial Lexis 1408, 20 Nov. 1997 413n
- *Dirshe* v. *Canada* (MCI), Decision No. IMM-2124-96 (1997) (TD), 1997 Fed. Ct. Trial Lexis 521, 2 July 1997 390
- *Dykon* v. *Canada* (MEI), (1994) 87 FTR 98 (TD), Sept. 1994 69n
- *Elmi* v. *Canada* (MCI), Decision No. IMM-580-98 (TD), (1999) Fed. Ct. Trial Lexis 220, 12 March 1999 73, 405n
- *Gil* v. *Canada* (MEI), [1995] 1 FC 508 (CA); (1994) 174 NR 292; (1994) 119 DLR (4th) 497 449n, 452
- *Gonzales-Cambana* v. *Canada* (MCI), Decision No. IMM-933-96 (TD) (1997); 1997 Fed. Ct. Trial Lexis 689 72n, 393n
- *Gonzalez* v. *Canada* (MEI), [1994] 3 FC 646 (CA); (1994) 115 DLR (4th) 403 451, 464n, 466n
- Jayabalasingham v. Canada (MCI), Decision No. IMM-140-98 (TD) (1998); 1998 Fed. Ct. Trial Lexis 1283 387–8n
- Mirza v. Canada (MCI), Decision No. IMM-4618-98 (TD) (1999); 1999 Fed.

Ct. Trial Lexis 842 399

- Pathmakanthan v. Canada (MEI), [1993] FCJ 1158 (TD) 413n
- Penate v. Canada (MEI), [1994] 3 FC 79 (TD) 382n
- Periyathamby v. Canada (MCI), (1995) 26 Imm LR (2d) 179 (TD) 387n
- *Rabbani* v. *Canada* (MCI), Decision No. IMM-236-96 (1997) (TD), 1997 Fed. Ct. Trial Lexis 681 415n

Ramanathan v. Canada (MCI), Decision No. IMM-5091-97 (1998) (TD); 1998 Fed.

Ct. Trial Lexis 1017 387–8n

- Ramirez v. Canada (MEI), [1992] 2 FC 306 (CA) 464n, 471
- Rasaratnam v. Canada (MEI), [1992] 1 FCJ 706 (CA), 1991 23n, 363n
- Saidi v. Canada (MEI), [1993] FCJ 932 (TD) 410n
- Sathananthan v. Canada (MCI), Decision No. IMM-5152-98 (1999) (TD); 1999 Fed.

Ct. Trial Lexis 1149 391

*Singh* v. *Canada* (MEI), (1993) FCJ 630 (TD), 23 June 1993 386n

Table of cases

Sivakumar v. Canada (MEI), [1994] 1 FC 433 (CA) 464n Soosaipillai v. Canada (MCI), Decision No. IMM-4846-98 (1999) (TD); 1999 Fed. Ct. Trial Lexis 834 409 Manickavasagam Suresh v. MCI and the Attorney-General of Canada, [2000] 2 FC 592 (CA), A-415-99, 18 Jan. 2000 453n, 456n, 460n, 463, 471, 476n, 478n Tawfik v. Canada (MEI), (1993) FCJ 835 (TD) 410n Thirunavukkarasu v. Canada (MEI), [1994] 1 FC 589 (CA) 23n, 27n, 365n, 390n, 415n Vidal v. Canada (MEI), Decision No. A-644-92 (1997) (TD); 1997 Fed. Ct. Trial Lexis 408 393n Zalzali v. Canada (MEI), [1991] 3 FC 605 (CA) 40n, 59n, 410n

Convention Refugee Determination Division (CRDD)

The Immigration and Refugee Board (IRB) of Canada maintains a database of recent Canadian immigration and refugee protection decisions known as RefLex, at http://www.irb.gc.ca/en/decisions/reflex/index.e.htm. It contains digests of decisions of the IRB's recently renamed Refugee Protection Division (formerly the Convention Refugee Determination Division), the Immigration Appeal Division, and the Immigration Division (formerly the Adjudication Division). Early issues also include digests of decisions by the Federal Court of Canada.

D.I.P. (Re), CRDD No. 288, 1996 63n G. (B.B.) (Re), CRDD No. 397, 1994 63n H.Z.G. (*Re*), 1999, CRDD No. 226 (Quicklaw) 571n I.P.A. (Re), 1999, CRDD No. 286 (Quicklaw) 571n M.V.J. (Re), 1998, CRDD No. 114 (Quicklaw) 571n R.O.I. (Re), CRDD No. 235, 1996 63n U.C.R. (Re), CRDD No. 94, 2001 63–4n W. (Z.D.) (Re), CRDD No. 3, No. U92-06668, 19 Feb. 1993 57n *Y.S.C. (Re)*, 1998, CRDD No. 26 (Quicklaw) 571n Decision No. T-91-04459, Jorge Alberto Inaudi, 4 April 1992 69n Decisions Nos. U95-00646, U95-00647, U95-00648, 15 Jan. 1997, 67 Reflex, 26 May 1997 57n Decision No. V95-02904, 26 Nov. 1997 62n Decision No. V95-01655 et al., Lalonde, 6 May 1998 571n Decision No. A98-00594 et al., Kagedan, Showler, 9 Dec. 1998 571n Decision No. T98-06186, CRDD No. 298, 2 Nov. 1999 54n, 62n Decision No. M99-04586 et al., Moss, 21 Dec. 1999 571n Decision No. TA0-05472, 30 May 2001 57n

xxxii Table of cases

#### France

#### Conseil d'Etat (Council of State)

Selected decisions from 1999 onwards can be found at http://www.conseil-etat.fr/ ce/home/index.shtml. The French government legal site http://legifrance. gouv.fr/ is also useful.

 Bereciartua-Echarri, Decision No. 85234, 1 April 1988
 459n

 Ourbih, Conseil d'Etat SSR, Decision No. 171858, 23 June 1997
 281–2, 296

 Pham, Conseil d'Etat SSR, Decision No. 148997, 21 May 1997
 459n

 Rajkumar, Conseil d'Etat SSR, 28 Sept. 1998
 454n

Cour de Cassation (Court of Cassation)

Fédération Nationale des Déportés et Internés Résistants et Patriotes et al. v. Barbie, 78ILR 125, 1985437n

#### Commission des recours des réfugiés (CRR, Refugee Appeal Commission)

Decision No. 369776, 7 Dec. 2001 282n A., 18 Sept. 1991 54n *Ahmed*, 30 Nov. 2000 53n, 72n Albu, Decision No. 347330, 3 April 2000 282n Aminata Diop, Decision No. 164078, 18 Sept. 1991 281n Aourai, Decision No. 343157, 22 Feb. 2000 54n, 282n Avetisan, Decision No. 303164, 4 April 1997 456n Benarbia, Decision No. 364301, 1 June 2001 282n Benedir, Decision No. 364663, 18 April 2001 282n Berang, Decision No. 334606, 6 May 1999 282n Brahim, Decision No. 228601, 29 Oct. 1993 456n Daghi, Decision No. 330627, 4 Oct. 2000 282n Djellal, CRR sections réunis (SR), Decision No. 328310, 12 May 1999 54n, 282n Elkebir, CRR (SR), Decision No. 237939, 22 July 1994 53n, 281n Elnov, Decision No. 318610, 23 July 1999 282n Kinda, Decision No. 366892, 19 March 2001 282n Krour, Decision No. 364839, 2 May 2001 282n *Kulik*, Decision No. 367645, 29 June 2001 282n Meguenine, 12 July 2001 54n

Muntumusi Mpemba, Decision No. 238444, 29 Oct. 1993 456n Ourbih, CRR SR, Decision No. 269875, 15 May 1998 54n, 281 Sahraoui, 8 Feb. 1995 53n Sissoko, CRR SR, Decisions Nos. 361050 and 373077, 7 Dec. 2001 282n Soumah, 7 Dec. 2001 54n Soumahoro, 17 July 1995 54n Tsypouchkine, Decision No. 318611, 23 July 1999 282n Wu, CRR SR, Decision No. 218361, 19 April 1994 281n Zhang, CRR SR, Decision No. 228044, 8 June 1993 281n

## Germany

Selected German jurisprudence is available in German at http://www.oefre.unibe.ch/law/dfr/dfr\_auswahl.html and at http://www.dejure.org/.

Bundesverfassungsgericht (Federal Constitutional Court)

Decisions since 1 Jan. 1998 can be found at http://www.bverfg.de/cgi-bin/link.pl?entscheidungen.

 Decision of 10 Nov. 1989, 2 BvR 403/84, 2 BvR 1501/84, Entscheidungssammlung zum Ausländer- und Asylrecht (EZAR) 203 No. 5
 362n

 Decision of 14 May 1996, 2 BvR 1938/93 and 2 BvR 2315/93
 211n

 Decision of 24 March 1997, 2 BvR 1024/95, NVwZ 97, 65
 73n, 405n

Bundesverwaltungsgericht (Federal Administrative Court)

 Decision of 15 March 1988, 9 C 378.86, 79 BVerwGE 143
 283n

 Decision of 14 Dec. 1993, BVerwG C 45.92
 402n

 Decision of 18 Jan. 1994, 9 C 48.92, 95 BVerwGE 42
 283n

 Decision of 8 Dec. 1998, BVerwG 9 C 17.98
 410n

 Decision of 30 March 1999, BVerwG 9 C 22.98, 23.98, 31.98
 458n

## Bundesgerichtshof Strafsenat (Federal Criminal Court)

Decision of 3 Nov. 1992, Case No. 5 StR 370/92, *Border Guards Prosecution* case, published in English in 100 ILR 364, available in German at http://www.uniwuerzburg.de/dfr/dfr.bsjahre.html. 438n

Oberverwaltungsgericht/Verwaltungsgerichtshof (Higher Administrative Court)

Baden-Württemberg Administrative Court (VGH Ba-Wü), Decision of 17 May 1990, A 12 S 533/89 404n Bavarian Higher Administrative Court (BayVGH), Decision of 7 June 1979, Antonin L. v. Federal Republic of Germany, Case No. 72 XII 77, published in English in 80 ILR 673, 1989, and in German in BayVwBl, 1979, 691 f 440n, 449n Bavarian Higher Administrative Court (BayVGH), Decision of 15 Nov. 1991, Az. 24 BZ 87.30943 386n Bavarian Higher Administrative Court (BayVGH), Decision of 23 March 2000, 23 B 99.32990 391n Hessen Higher Administrative Court (HessVGH), Decision of 14 Nov. 1988, 13 TH 1094/87, InfAuslR 1998, 17 283n Hessen Higher Administrative Court (HessVGH), Decision of 2 May 1990, UE 1568/84 392n Schleswig-Holstein Higher Administrative Court (NiedersOVG), Decisions of 18

Feb. 1998, 2 L 166/96 and 2 L 41/96 410n

Verwaltungsgerichte (Administrative Courts)

- Bavarian Administrative Court (VG Ansbach), Decision of 30 May 1990, AN 12 K 89.39598 386n
- Frankfurt Administrative Court (VG Frankfurt/M), Decision of 23 Oct. 1996, 5 E 33532/94.A(3), NVwZ-Beilage 6/1997, p. 46 284n
- Frankfurt Administrative Court (VG Frankfurt/M), Decision of 7 Sept. 2001, 1 E 31666/97.A(1) 52n

Wiesbaden Administrative Court (VG Wiesbaden), Decision of 26 April 1983, IV/1 E 06244/81 66n, 67n, 283n

Oberstes Landesgericht (Supreme State Court)

- The internet address of the Bavarian Supreme Court is http://www.justiz. bayern.de/bayoblg/index.html.
- Decision No. 1 Ss 545/86, Oberlandesgericht Celle, NvwZ 1987, 533 (ZaöRV) 48 [1988], 741, 13 Jan. 1987 202

Decision No. 20/96, *Public Prosecutor* v. *Djajić*, Bavarian Supreme Court (Bayerisches Oberstes Landesgericht), 23 May 1997, excerpted in 1998 *Neue Deutsche Wochenschrift* 392 430n

Decision No. 230/99, Bayerisches Oberstes Landesgericht, 14 Jan. 2000 202n

Table of cases

## Landesgericht (State Court)

Decision No. 39 Js 688/86 (108/88), Regional Superior Court (Landesgericht) Münster, 20 Dec. 1988 (appeal by Public Prosecutor rejected by Appeals Court (Oberlandesgericht) in Hamm, 3 May 1989) 201n

## Greece

Court of First Instance (Criminal Cases)

Decision No. 585/1993, Shimon Akram and Others, Court of First Instance (Criminal Cases), Myttilini (Aftoforo Trimeles Plimeliodikeio Myttilinis), 1993 202
Decision No. 233/1993, Court of First Instance (Criminal Cases), Chios (Aftoforo Trimeles Plimeliodikeio Chiou), 1993 202n

## The Netherlands

Hoge Raad der Nederlanden (Supreme Court of the Netherlands)

Decision of 11 Nov. 1997, (Criminal Division), No. 3717 AB 430n Decision of 9 Dec. 1988, *Shokuh* v. *The Netherlands, Revue du droit des étrangers* (RDDE), No. 52, Jan.–Feb. 1989, p. 16 220n

Raad van State (Council of State)

Decision No. A-2.0273, 1980 386n A.R.R. v. S., 1982, and A.R.R. v. S., 1988 395n R.V., 1982, and R.V., 1994 395n Decision No. 6 GV 18d-21, Afdeling Bestuursrechtspraak van de Raad van State (Administrative Law Division of the Council of State), 7 Nov. 1996, RV 1996, (China) 284n

## Rechtseenheidskamer (REK, Law Unity Chamber)

AWB 98/3068 VRWET, Osman Egal v. State Secretary for Justice, The Hague District Court (Administrative Law Sector/Unity of Law Division for Aliens' Affairs), 27 Aug. 1998 626n
AWB 99/73, 3 June 1999 410n
AWB 99/104, 3 June 1999 410n
AWB 99/3380, 13 Sept. 1999 412n

## New Zealand

The RSAA has a website at www.nzrefugeeappeals.govt.nz. Leading RSAA decisions and selected High Court and Court of Appeal cases dealing with refugee issues can also be found at http://www.refugee.org.nz.

## High Court of New Zealand

Refugee Council of New Zealand Inc. and the Human Rights Foundation of Aotearoa New Zealand Inc. and D. v. Attorney-General, Case No. M1881-AS01, interim judgment 31 May 2002, supplementary judgment 27 June 2002 230n

## Court of Appeal

Decisions since 1999 can be found at http://www.austlii.edu.au/nz/cases/ NZCA/. Butler v. Attorney-General, [1999] NZAR 205 337n, 378n, 388 King-Ansell v. Police, [1979] 2 NZLR 531 343n

New Zealand Refugee Status Appeals Authority (RSAA)

ReC., Refugee Appeal No. 70366/96, [1997] 4 HKC 236 338n *Re G.J.*, Refugee Appeal No. 1312/93, 1 NLR 387, 1995 54n, 276n, 280, 286n, 290n, 292n, 304n ReM.N., Refugee Appeal No. 2039/93, 12 Feb. 1996 53n, 68n, 280n, 344n, 346n *Re R.S.*, Decision No. 135/92, 18 June 1993 383n, 398n ReS., Decision No. 11/91, 5 Sept. 1991 365n *ReS.A.*, Refugee Appeal No. 1/92, 30 April 1992 627n ReS.K., Refugee Appeal No. 29/91, 17 Feb. 1992 466n *ReS.Y.*, Refugee Appeal No. 915/92, 29 Aug. 1994 53n Decision No. 1613/93 393n Refugee Appeal No. 2223/94, 30 July 1996 53n Decision No. 70951/98, 5 Aug. 1998 371n, 412n Refugee Appeal No. 71462/99, 27 Sept. 1999 38n Refugee Appeal No. 71684/99, 29 Oct. 1999, [2000] INLR 165 337n, 361, 364n Decision No. 71729/99, 22 June 2000, [2001] NZAR 183 404n, 414n

Refugee Appeal No. 71427/99, 16 Aug. 2000 53n, 280n, 302, 321n, 327n, 328n, 330n, 331n, 333n, 340n, 342n, 344n, 346n

### **Russian Federation**

Moscow Central Administrative District Zamoskvoretsky Municipal Court

S.A.K. v. Moscow and Moscow Region Immigration Control Department, Civil Case No. 2-3688, 10 May 2001 583n

# Switzerland

Tribunal fédéral/Schweizerisches Bundesgericht/Tribunale federale (Swiss Federal Tribunal)

Judgments available in German, French, and Italian at http://www.bger.ch.

 Re Kavic, Bjelanovic and Arsenijevic, 19 ILR 371, 1952
 446n, 472n

 Ktir v. Ministère Public Fédéral, 34 ILR 143, 1961
 449n

 Re Pavan, [1927-8] Ann. Dig. 347
 449n

 Watin v. Ministère Public Fédéral, 72 ILR 614, 1964
 449n

Bundesgericht, Kassationshof (Federal Cassation Court)

Judgment of 17 March 1999, reported in *Asyl* 2/99, 21-3 202n

Asylrekurskommission/Commission suisse de recours en matière d'asile/Commissione Svizzera di ricorso in materia d'asilo (Swiss Asylum Appeal Board)

Leading decisions of the Swiss Asylum Appeal Board since 1993 can be found as Jurisprudence et Informations de la CRA (JIRCA) / Entscheidungen und Mitteilungen der ARK (Entscheidsammlung EMARK) at http://www. ark-cra.ch/f/willkommen.htm.

Decision of 27 Nov. 1992, S.A.M. v. B.F.F. 451n Decision of 21 April 1993, (French-speaking division), 4th Ch., No. 138 356 395n Decision of 6 Dec. 1994, (French-speaking division), 2nd Ch., No. 175 287 386n

# United Kingdom

The text of selected UK judgments can be found at the British and Irish Legal Information Institute at http://www.bailii.org/, and the Court Service website at http://www.courtservice.gov.uk/.

### House of Lords

- House of Lords judgments delivered since 14 Nov. 1996 are available on http://www.parliament.the-stationery-office.co.uk/pa/ld199697/ldjudgmt/ ldjudgmt.htm.
- *Adan* v. *Secretary of State for the Home Department*, [1999] 1 AC 293 40n, 59n, 60n, 332n

Horvath v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, [2000] 3 WLR 381; [2000] 3 AllER 577, 6 July 200040n, 59n, 60, 327n, 330n, 332n, 333n, 336n, 366n,372n, 373n, 626n

Islam v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, see R. v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal and Secretary of State for the Home Department ex parte Shah

Mandla v. Dowell Lee, [1983] 2 AC 548 343n

- R. v. Bartle and the Commissioner of Police for the Metropolis and Others, ex parte Pinochet;
  R. v. Evans and Another and the Commissioner of Police for the Metropolis and Others, ex parte Pinochet (On Appeal from a Divisional Court of the Queen's Bench Division),
  Opinions of the Lords of Appeal for Judgment (Pinochet I), 25 Nov. 1998;
  Opinions of the Lords of Appeal for Judgment, Oral Judgment (Pinochet II), 17
  Dec. 1998 (Reasons, 15 Jan. 1999) 430, 439n
- R. v. Bartle and the Commissioner of Police for the Metropolis and Others, ex parte Pinochet;
   R. v. Evans and Another and the Commissioner of Police for the Metropolis and Others, ex parte Pinochet (On Appeal from a Divisional Court of the Queen's Bench Division), Final Decision, 24 March 1999, [1999] 2 WLR 827
- R. v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal and Secretary of State for the Home Department ex parte Shah, and Islam v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, conjoined appeals, [1999] 2 WLR 1015; [1999] INLR 144; [1999] 2 AC 629 39n, 53n, 62, 264n, 267, 268n, 273–5, 276n, 277n, 286n 287–8, 291, 294, 297, 303–4n, 308, 309, 321n, 330n, 332n, 340–2n, 345–6346n, 366, 474n, 626n

R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Adan; R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Aitseguer (conjoined appeals), [2001] 2 WLR 143; [2001] 1 All ER 593 38n, 332n, 427n

- R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department ex parte Bugdaycay, [1987] AC 514, [1987] 1 All ER 940, 19 Feb. 1987 625n
- R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Sivakumaran, [1988] 1 All ER 193 378n
- Secretary of State for the Home Department v. Rehman, [2001] UKHL 47, 11 Oct. 2001 460n
- T. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, [1996] 2 All ER 865, 22 May 1996 449, 626

# Court of Appeal

(Civil Division unless otherwise stated)

Abdulaziz Faraj v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, [1999] INLR 451 330n Adan v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, [1997] 2 All ER 723 379n, 400n Alsawaf v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, [1988] Imm AR 410, 26 April 1988 625n Canaj v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, [2001] INLR 342 337n Abdul Hussain, unreported, 17 Dec. 1998 440n Karanakaran v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, [2000] 3 All ER 449 367-8, 369n, 378n, 400 Alimas Khaboka v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, [1993] Imm AR 484 201 R. v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal, ex parte Mahendran, unreported, 13 July 1999 370n R. v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal, ex parte Sivanentheran, [1997] Imm AR 504 406n R. v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal and Secretary of State for the Home Department, *ex parte Shah*, [1997] Imm AR 145, 153 309 R. v. Moussa Membar et al., Court of Appeal (Criminal Division), [1983] Criminal Law Review 618 453n R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Adan and ex parte Aitseguer, [1999] 3 WLR 1274 455n R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department and another, ex parte Robinson [1997] 4 All ER 210, 11 July 1997 27n, 400n, 406 Secretary of State for the Home Department v. Khalif Mohamed Abdi, [1994] Imm AR 402, 20 April 1994 626 Secretary of State for the Home Department v. Rehman, [2000] 3 All ER 778 442n, 460n Secretary of State for the Home Department v. Z; A. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department; M. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, conjoined appeal of cases nos. C/2001/2766, C/2001/2520 and C/2001/2325, [2002] ECWA Civ 952, 5 July 2002 22n

Thavathevathasan v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, [1994] Imm AR 249, 22 Dec. 1993 626n

#### High Court of Justice (Queen's Bench Division)

- Mehmet Brahimi v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal and Secretary of State for the Home Department, Case No. CO/2238/2001 77n
- R. v. Governor of Brixton Prison, ex parte Kolczynski et al., [1955] 1 QB 540, [1955] 1 All ER 31 446n, 469n
- R. v. Governor of Pentonville Prison, ex parte Tzu-Tsai Cheng, [1973] AC 931, 24 Jan. 1973 448n
- R. v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal, ex parte Guang, Decision No. CO/3029/98, 1 Sept. 1999 384
- R. v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal, ex parte Jonah, [1985] Imm AR 7 362n
- R. v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal, ex parte Probakaran, [1996] Imm AR 603 370n
- R. v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal, ex parte Sui Rong Suen, [1997] Imm AR 355 384n
- R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Akar, Decision No. CO/1789/99, 17 Sept. 1999 (unreported) 371
- R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Binbasi, [1989] Imm AR 595, 20 July 1989 66n
- R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Gunes, [1991] Imm AR
  278 363n
- R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department ex parte Makoyi, Decision No. CO/2372/91, 21 Nov. 1991 194n
- R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Mehari et al., [1994] QB 474, [1994] 2 All ER 494, 8 Oct. 1993 626n
- R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Sasitharan, [1998] Imm AR 487 330n
- R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Singh, Decision No. CO/2696/98, 3 March 1999 (unreported) 370–1
- R. v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Virk, [1995] EWJ 707, 18 Aug. 1995 204n

# High Court of Justice (Divisional Court)

- R. v. Special Adjudicator ex parte B., 17 Sept. 1997 227n
- R. v. Uxbridge Magistrates' Court and Another, ex parte Adimi, [1999] Imm AR 560, 29 July 1999; [1999] 4 All ER 520 38n, 191–2, 193, 197–8, 201, 203–4, 213, 626

Table of cases

#### Immigration Appeal Tribunal

Ashokanathan, Decision No. 13294389Baglan, Decision No. 12620390nDupovac, Decision No. R11846, 8 Feb. 1995368nDzhygun, Appeal No. CC-50627-99 (00TH00728), 17 May 200054n, 62Gashi and Nikshiqi, Appeal No. HX/ 75677/95, (13695), 22 July 1996, [1997]INLR 96448nMontoya, Appeal No. CC/15806/2000, 27 April 200118n, 274n, 295–6, 298Yang, Decision No. 13952, 1996391n

#### Social Security Commissioner

Case No. CIS 4439/98, 25 Nov. 1999 192n, 204n

#### **United States**

Judgments of the United States Supreme Court, federal courts, the New York Court of Appeals and other state courts can be found at http://www.law. cornell.edu/.

#### Supreme Court of the United States

Judgments are available at http://www.supremecourtus.gov/.

 Immigration and Naturalization Service v. Aguirre-Aguirre, 526 US 415, 119 S.Ct 1439, 143 L. Ed. (2d) 590 (1999)
 450, 626n

 Immigration and Naturalization Service v. Cardoza-Fonseca, 480 US 421; 107 S.Ct 1207; 1987 US Lexis 1059; 94 L. Ed. (2d) 434; 55 USLW 4313, 9 March 1987
 626n

 Shaughnessy v. United States ex rel. Mezei, 345 US 206 (1953)
 222n

 Zadvydas v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, Case No. 99-7791, 28 June 2001
 229

#### Court of Appeals (First Circuit)

Ananeh-Firempong v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 766 F. 2d 621 (1st Circuit), 1985 278n
Gebremichael v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 10 F. 3d 28 (1st Circuit), 1993 276n

### Court of Appeals (Second Circuit)

Azzouka v. Meese, 820 F.2d 585 (2nd Circuit) 461n Filartiga v. Pena Irala, 630 F.2d 876 (2nd Circuit), 1980 151n, 154n Gomez v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 947 F.2d 660 (2nd Circuit), 1991 276n, 279

# Court of Appeals (Third Circuit)

Etugh v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 921 F. 2d 36 (3rd Circuit),1990363n, 369n, 390nFatin v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 12 F. 3d 1233 (3rd Circuit),199353n, 276n

# Court of Appeals (Fifth Circuit)

Abdel-Masieh v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 73 F.3d 579 (5th Circuit), 1996 398n

# Court of Appeals (Seventh Circuit)

- Grajo v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 124 F.3d 203 (7th Circuit), 1997 52n
- *Iliev v. Immigration and Naturalization Service*, 127 F.3d 638 (7th Circuit), 1997 276n

*Lwin v. Immigration and Naturalization Service*, 144 F.3d 505 (7th Circuit), 1998 276n, 277–8n

# Court of Appeals (Ninth Circuit)

- Aguirre-Cervantes v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 2001 US App. Lexis 26170(9th Circuit), 21 March 2001, 242 F. 3d 1169 (9th Circuit), 200153n,277-8n, 305
- Chanchavac v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 2000 US App. Lexis 5066 (9th Circuit), 27 March 2000 396n
- Damaize-Job v. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 787 F. 2d 1332 (9th Circuit), 1986 397n
- *Fisher* v. *Immigration and Naturalization Service*, 79 F. 3d 955 (9th Circuit), 1996 53n

05 (9th Circuit),
25 F. 3d 1084
z, 813 F. 2d 1432 (9th
3d 1167 (9th Circuit),
F. 2d 1571 (9th Circuit),
6–7

#### **District Courts**

Ali v. Reno, District Court for the Southern District of New York, 829 F.Supp. 1415 (1993) 461n
Avila v. Rivkind, District Court for the Southern District of Florida, 724 F.Supp.

945 (1989) 461n

Beharry v. Reno, Eastern District of New York, 8 Jan. 2002, 2002 US Dist. Lexis 757 568n

#### Board of Immigration Appeals

Attorney General and BIA precedent decisions can be found at http://www.usdoj. gov/eoir/efoia/bia/biaindx.htm. BIA decisions by volume and Interim Decision No. can be found at http://www.usdoj.gov/eoir/vll/intdec/ lib\_intdecitnet.html.

In ReA.E.M., Interim Decision No. 3338, 20 Feb. 1998 368n *In Re C.A.L.*, Decision No. A70-684-022, 21 Feb. 1997 368, 394n In Re H., Interim Decision No. 3276, 1996 276n, 390n In Re Kasinga, Interim Decision No. 3278, 1996, 21 I. & N. Decisions 357, 1996 54n, 264n, 276n, 289, 302n, 321n *In Re Q.T.M.T.*, Interim Decision No. 3300, 23 Dec. 1996 450n, 462, 466n, 470n Matter of Acosta, Interim Decision No. 2986, 19 I. & N. Decisions 211, 1 March 273n, 274-8, 280, 294n, 296, 307, 362n 1985 Matter of Chang, 20 I. & N. Decisions 38, 1989 276n, 286n, 306n Matter of D.V., Interim Decision No. 3252, 25 May 1993 52n Matter of Fuentes, 19 I. & N. Decisions 658, 1988 276n *Matter of R.*, Interim Decision No. 3195, 15 Dec. 1992 368n, 394n, 413n

 Matter of R.A., Interim Decision No. 3403, 11 June 1999
 50n, 53n, 62n, 268n, 276n, 280n, 287n, 301–2, 305, 309

 Matter of S.A., Interim Decision No. 3433, 27 June 2000
 53n, 343n

 Matter of Tenorio, File No. A72-093-558, 1999
 55n

 Matter of Toboso-Alfonso, 20 I. & N. Decisions 819 (BIA), 1990
 276n

#### **Immigration Courts**

Matter of D., Immigration Court, San Francisco, California, 3 July 1996, available at http://www.uchastings.edu/cgrs/law/ij/9.pdf 53n
 Matter of J.M., Immigration Court, San Pedro, California, 3 Dec. 1996, available on http://www.uchastings.edu/cgrs/law/ij/364.pdf 62n

See additionally p. 448n for successive extradition hearings before US courts, ranging from the Board of Immigration Appeals to the Supreme Court, *In the Matter of Artukovic*, 140 F.Supp 245 (1956); 247 F.2d 198 (1957); 355 US 393 (1958); 170 F.Supp 383 (1959). Artukovic was eventually extradited thirty years later – 628 F.Supp 1370 (1985); 784 F.2d 1354 (9<sup>th</sup> Circuit 1986).

# Table of treaties and other international instruments

A table of ratifications of key international instruments which include a *non-refoulement* component is given in Annex 2.1 to Part 2.1 of this book.

1907 Hague Convention V Respecting the Rights and Duties of Neut	
	Powers and Persons in Case of War on Land, 2 American Journal of
	International Law Supp., 1908, 117 page 439n
1919	Constitution of the International Labour Organization 637n, 640
1922	Arrangements with regard to the issue of certificates of identity to
	Russian refugees, 5 July 1922, LNTS, vol. XIII, no. 355 99n
1922	Arrangements relating to the issue of identity certificates to Russian and
	Armenian refugees, supplementing and amending the previous
	arrangements, 5 July, 31 May 1924, 12 May 1926, LNTS, vol. LXXXIX,
	no. 2004 99n
1926	Slavery Convention, 212 UNTS 17 636n
1928	Arrangements relating to the legal status of Russian and Armenian
	refugees, 30 June 1928, LNTS, vol. LXXXIX, no. 2005 99n
1933	Convention Relating to the International Status of Refugees, 28 June
	1933, LNTS, vol. CLIX, no. 3663 99n
1936	Provisional arrangement concerning the status of refugees coming from
	Germany, 4 July 1936, LNTS, vol. CLXXI, no. 3952 99n
1938	Convention Concerning the Status of Refugees Coming from Germany,
	10 Feb. 1938, LNTS, vol. CXCII, no. 4461 99n
1939	Additional Protocol to the 1936 Provisional Arrangement and 1938
	Convention Concerning the Status of Refugees Coming from Germany,
	14 Sept. 1939, LNTS, vol. CXCVIII, no. 4634 99n
1945	Charter of the International Military Tribunal, in Agreement for the
	Prosecution and Punishment of the Major War Criminals of the
	European Axis (London Agreement), 8 Aug. 1945, 82 UNTS 280 94,
	426n, 433
1945	Statute of the International Court of Justice 649
1945	United Nations Charter 99, 105, 153, 291, 320, 444, 456
	Art. 1 320n, 455–6, 465n, 467n
	Art. 2 141, 455–6

	Art. 22 94
	Art. 55 477n
	Art. 56 477n, 618, 661
	Art. 96 649, 655n
	Art. 103 477n
1945	UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)
	Constitution, 16 Nov. 1945 641
1948	Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of
	Genocide, 78 UNTS 277 433, 435, 444n, 446, 636n
1948	Universal Declaration of Human Rights, UNGA res. 217 A (III), 10 Dec.
	1948 100, 107, 291, 320n, 327–9
	Art. 2 344
	Art. 5 152–4
	Art. 7 320n
	Art. 12 566n
	Art. 13(2) 526n
	Art. 14 82, 94, 115, 231, 426n, 455n, 466n, 557n
	Art. 16 566n, 604
	Art. 29(3) 456n
1949	First Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the
	Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field, 75 UNTS 31 336n,
	431, 437, 441, 462n, 469, 568, 645
1949	Second Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of
	Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea, 75
	UNTS 85 336n, 431, 437, 441, 462n, 469, 568, 645
1949	Third Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War,
	77 UNTS 135 336n, 431, 437, 441, 462n, 469, 568, 645
1949	Fourth Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons
	in Time of War, 75 UNTS 287 336n, 430, 431, 437, 441, 462n, 469,
	567n, 568, 576, 645
1950	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and
	Fundamental Freedoms, ETS No. 5, 213 UNTS 221         13, 105, 147,
	159, 567, 637–8
	Art. 1 110n, 111, 145, 187n,
	Art. 2 132n, 453
	Art. 3 13, 54, 92, 111, 144–5, 152–3, 155–6, 158, 217, 396n, 428n,
	453, 461n, 475–6, 518n, 575, 629
	Art. 4(1) 132n
	Art. 5 15n, 205, 211, 222n
	Art. 6 217, 428n, 461n
	Art. 8 518n, 566n, 568n, 575–6, 604
	Art. 12 566n
	Art. 13 188n, 217, 461n, 476

```
Art. 15
                    132n, 156, 162n, 462n
         Art. 17
                    162n
         Art. 25
                    650n
         Art. 33
                    636n
1950
         Statute of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for
         Refugees, A/RES/428 (V), 14 Dec. 1950
                                                   17n, 35, 70, 499, 523, 534,
         544,615,618
         Para. 1
                    93
         Para. 4
                    97,659
         Para. 6
                    70n, 94-5, 492, 516, 519n
         Para. 7
                    94n, 95, 426n, 447-8
         Para. 8
                    618, 620, 623n, 668
         Para. 9
                    95
1951
         Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees, 189 UNTS 150, 98-101,
         326-7, 367-80 (General references to the Convention are not included
         here as they are too numerous.)
         Travaux préparatoires
                                106, 119, 123, 130, 136, 189, 202, 265, 294, 375,
         427, 447, 452
         Preamble
                       13, 37n, 46, 189, 290-1, 324, 332n, 344, 374, 385, 405,
         406, 454, 570
         Art. 1
                   24, 40, 186, 193, 216, 253, 363
         Art. 1A
                    372n, 459, 462, 571, 615
         Art. 1A(1)
                       516, 518-20
         Art. 1A(2)
                      xxi, 16, 32, 39n, 41, 47, 51, 55-7, 61, 67, 75, 79, 100, 102,
         107, 115-17, 118, 123-7, 264, 267, 323, 325, 351, 365, 377n, 410, 452,
         464-6, 518-19, 520n, 528, 548, 655n
         Art. 1B(1)
                       114
         Art. 1C
                    xxi, 31, 47, 75, 324, 458, 543
                       31, 378, 492, 523-5, 540, 544, 545, 550
         Art. 1C(1)
                      31, 492, 523, 525-7, 540, 544, 545, 550
         Art. 1C(2)
         Art. 1C(3)
                      31, 492, 523, 525, 527-8, 540-1, 544, 545, 550
                      31, 492, 523, 528-9, 540, 541, 544, 545, 550
         Art. 1C(4)
         Art. 1C(5)
                      31, 75, 77, 382n, 493, 494-5, 499-519, 533-6, 543, 544,
         545-8
         Art. 1C(6)
                       31, 75, 493, 495, 499–519, 526, 533–6, 543–4,
         545-8
         Art. 1D
                    324
         Art. 1E
                    324
         Art. 1F
                    xxi, 28-30, 47, 83, 100, 129, 136, 139, 324, 426-32, 450,
         457-9, 463-74, 476, 478, 480, 484, 513, 569, 573
         Art. 1F(a)
                      73, 426, 432, 433-9, 447, 450, 453, 455, 466, 471, 480-1
                      29, 73, 130, 426, 432, 439-55, 457, 466, 471, 480-2
         Art. 1F(b)
         Art. 1F(c)
                      426, 447, 450, 455-7, 466, 481-2
```

1951

```
Arts. 2–33
              27, 102, 106, 408-9, 411, 474n
Art. 2
         256
Art. 3
         216,323
Art. 4
         408n, 569n
Art. 5
         569n
Art. 8
         221
Art. 9
         195-6,221
Art. 12
          33n, 569n, 581n
Art. 15
          408n
Art. 16
          408n
Art. 17
          409n
Art. 18
          409n
Art. 19
          409n
Art. 20
          409n
Art. 21
          409n
Art. 22
          409n, 569n
Art. 23
          409n
Art. 24
          33n, 409n, 569n
Art. 26
          196, 221, 409n
Art. 28
          197, 209, 411n, 524n
          xxi, 14, 100, 107, 116-17, 186-8, 191-6, 201-6, 209, 213,
Art. 31
215-19, 226, 229, 234, 253-5, 257, 569
Art. 31(1)
             14, 123-4, 188-9, 193-5, 198, 202, 216-19, 222, 247-8,
254-6
Art. 31(2)
             14, 186, 195-6, 219, 222-3, 230-2, 254-7
           11, 12, 101, 107, 156, 196n, 460-1, 464, 530-44, 574
Art. 32
          xxi, 9-13, 90, 101, 106-7, 149, 156, 178, 216-17, 426, 462,
Art. 33
474, 481, 484, 530, 569, 615
Art. 33(1)
             108, 109, 112–15, 117, 118, 121–7, 134, 403
             11-12, 30, 83, 108, 112, 128-40, 179, 427, 457-64, 470,
Art. 33(2)
477n, 513, 530, 573
Art. 34
          32, 528, 543
Art. 35
          xxi, 9, 36, 101, 226, 258, 494, 533, 615-19, 622-7, 630-1,
634,651-4,658-9,661-3,667-9
Art. 36
          669
          427n, 632, 636, 653n
Art. 38
Art. 39
          633n
Art. 42
           101-2, 107, 617
Final Act of the United Nations Conference of Plenipotentiaries on the
Status of Refugees and Stateless Persons, 1951, UN doc.
A/CONF.2/108/Rev.1, 189 UNTS 137
                                       xxi, 33, 99n, 557, 569n, 586,
605
```

1952 Convention on the Political Rights of Women, 193 UNTS 135 636n

- 1954 Caracas Convention on Territorial Asylum, OAS Treaty SeriesNo. 19 222
- 1954 Convention Relating to the Status of Stateless Persons, 360UNTS 117 636n
- 1957 European Convention on Extradition, ETS No. 24 93, 112, 447n
- 1958 Geneva Convention on the Continental Shelf 142
- 1960 UNESCO Convention Against Discrimination in Education, 14 Dec.1960 637
- 1961 European Social Charter, ETS No. 35 605, 639n
- 1961Single Convention on Narcotic Drugs, as amended by the 1972 Protocol<br/>Amending the Single Convention on Narcotic Drugs646n
- 1962 Protocol of 10 Dec. 1962 Instituting a Conciliation and Good Offices
   Commission to be Responsible for Seeking a Settlement of Any Disputes
   which May Arise Between States Parties to the 1960 Convention Against
   Discrimination in Education 637
- 1963 Protocol No. 4 to the 1950 European Human Rights Convention, 16Sept. 1963, ETS No. 46 156, 222n
- 1963Tokyo Convention on Offences and Certain Other Acts Committed on<br/>Board Aircraft, UKTS 126 (1969), Cmnd 4230431n
- 1965International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial<br/>Discrimination, 660 UNTS 195328, 567n, 636–7n, 639n, 650n
- 1966Asian-African Legal Consultative Committee, Principles Concerning<br/>Treatment of Refugees90, 113, 118, 123, 125, 127, 130, 140, 144, 147
- 1966
   International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 999 UNTS 171, 6

   ILM (1967) 368
   12, 93, 147, 159–61, 320, 327–9, 334, 406–7, 438n, 567n, 595
  - Art. 2 110, 187n, 320n, 324
  - Art. 3 320n
  - Art. 4 132n, 162n, 461n
  - Art. 5(1) 162n
  - Art. 6(1) 132n
  - Art. 7 92, 144–6, 152–3, 157–9, 475n, 476n, 518n, 628
  - Art. 8 132n
  - Art. 9 208, 222n, 227
  - Art. 12 222, 372n, 526n
  - Art. 13 574
  - Art. 14 188n, 195
  - Art. 15(1) 194–5
  - Art. 17 66n, 518n, 566n, 575, 605
  - Art. 23 566n, 605
  - Art. 26 320n, 324, 344

	Art. 40 639n	
	Art. 41 636n	
	Art. 42 637n	
1966	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, UNGA	
	res. 220 A (XXI), 993 UNTS 3 327–9, 407, 566n, 567n, 568, 605, 639n	
1966	Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political	
	Rights, UNGA res. 2200 A (XXI), 16 Dec. 1966 567n, 650n	
	Art. 1 110	
	Art. 5(4) 650n	
1967	Declaration on Territorial Asylum, UNGA res. 2132 (XXII), 14 Dec.	
	1967 91, 113, 118, 125, 127, 130, 140, 144, 147, 164	
1967 Protocol attached to the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status		
	Refugees, 606 UNTS 267 3, 6, 9, 35, 44, 46, 52, 81, 95–6, 101–3, 128,	
	140, 146–8, 178, 188, 197, 207, 218, 326, 380, 426n, 605, 654–8, 664–6	
	Art. I 102, 106, 108, 114, 115	
	Art. II 9, 35, 102, 615–19, 624–5, 627, 634, 651, 653, 658–9, 661–3	
	Art. IV 632, 636, 653n	
	Art. V 633n	
	Art. VII 102, 107	
1968	Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons 647	
1969	American Convention on Human Rights or 'Pact of San José, Costa Rica',	
Organization of American States (OAS) Treaty Series no. 35, 1144 U		
	123, 9 ILM 673 118, 125, 131, 143, 147, 159, 649	
	Art. 1(1) 110n, 187n	
	Art. 4(1) 132n	
	Art. 5 132n, 152–3, 158, 475n, 518n	
	Art. 7 15n, 222n	
	Art. 11 518n, 566n	
	Art. 17 566n, 605	
	Art. 22(8) 91	
	Art. 25 188n	
	Art. 27 132n, 162n	
	Art. 32 585n	
	Art. 44 650n	
	Art. 45 636n	
1000	Art. 64 649n	
1969	Organization of African Unity (OAU) Convention Governing the Specific	
Aspects of Refugee Problems in Africa, 1001 UNTS 45 23, 59,		
	113, 118, 120, 123, 125, 127, 131–2, 143, 147, 475n, 522, 549, 586–7,	
	632 Art I(2) 23p 257p	
	Art. I(2)23n, 357nArt. I(4)426n, 492, 512, 513, 518, 523, 525–30, 540, 541–2, 545–50	
	Art. I(4)       426n, 492, 512, 513, 518, 523, 525–30, 540, 541–2, 545–50         Art. I(5)       426n, 455n, 520	

Art. I(5) 426n, 455n, 530

	Art. II 91, 221, 457n
	Art. III 221, 457n, 460n, 530
	Art. VI 524n
	Art. VIII 618, 653n, 661
	Art. IX 632n
1969	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1155 UNTS 331 188, 373,
	378
	Art. 27 427n
	Art. 30 477n
	Art. 31 103–4, 189, 194, 324n, 373n, 427n, 569n, 578n
	Art. 32 103–6, 189, 194, 427n
	Art. 33 189
	Art. 44 454
	Art. 62 454
	Art. 64 454
1970	Convention for the Suppression of the Unlawful Seizure of Aircraft,
	done at The Hague, 16 Dec. 1970, 10 ILM 133, 1971 431n
1971	Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts Against the Safety
	of Civil Aviation, done at Montreal, 23 Sept. 1971, 10 ILM 1151,
	1971 431n
1972	Convention on the Prohibition of the Development, Production and
	Stockpiling of Bacteriological (Biological) and Toxin Weapons and on
	their Destruction 648
1973	Convention on Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of Apartheid,
	13 ILM 50, 1974 446
1974	New York Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of Crimes
	Against Internationally Protected Persons Including Diplomatic Agents,
	13 ILM 42, 1974 431n
1977	Additional Protocol I to the Geneva Conventions, 1125 UNTS 3 336,
	430, 431, 437, 439n, 567n, 568, 577, 605, 645
1977	Additional Protocol II to the Geneva Conventions, 1125 UNTS 609
	336n, 431, 438, 472n, 567n, 568, 592n
1977	European Convention for the Suppression of Terrorism, ETS No. 90
	431n, 441, 446, 447n
1979	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination
	Against Women, 1249 UNTS 13 49, 320, 328, 331, 333, 567n, 636n,
	639n
1979	Hostages Convention, 18 ILM 1456, 1979 431n
1980	Convention on the Physical Protection of Nuclear Material, 1456
	UNTS 124 431n
1980	Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain
	Conventional Weapons Which May be Deemed to be Excessively
	Injurious or to Have Indiscriminate Effects of 10 Oct. 1980 648

1981	981 African Charter of Human and Peoples' Rights (Banjul Charter)		
	58, 1982	15n, 144, 147, 152–3, 158, 162n, 222n, 475n, 566n	
	585–6n, 605, 636n, 639n, 650n		

- 1981 Inter-American Convention on Extradition, OAS Treaty Series No. 60 93, 112
- Protocol No. 6 to the 1950 European Human Rights Convention, concerning the abolition of the death penalty, 28 April, ETS
   No. 114 13
- Cartagena Declaration on Refugees, embodying the Conclusions of the Colloquium on the International Protection of Refugees in Central America, Mexico and Panama held in Cartagena, 19–22 Nov. 1984, UNHCR, *Collection of International Instruments and Other Legal Texts concerning Refugees and Displaced Persons*, UNHCR, Geneva, 1995, vol. II, pp. 206–11 59, 81, 92, 120, 125, 127, 131, 141, 144, 147, 582n, 587, 618, 661

 1984 Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, UN doc. A/RES/39/46, 10 Dec. 1984 12–13, 93, 143, 146–7, 149, 152, 161, 452, 567n

- Art. 1 475n
- Art. 2 162n
- Art. 3 92, 144–5, 155, 158–9, 161, 453, 475–6, 477n, 518n, 530, 587, 628
- Art. 16 152n, 476n
- Art. 17 161n
- Art. 19 635n
- Art. 21 636–7n
- Art. 22 161n, 650n
- Art. 30 636n
- 1985 Convention Against Apartheid in Sports, 1500 UNTS 161 636n
- 1987 European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 26 Nov. 1987, ETS No. 126
   649n
- Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer, 16 Sept.1987, 1522 UNTS 3 649n
- 1988 Rome Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts Against the Safety of Maritime Navigation, IMO doc. SUA/CON/15, 10 March, 27 ILM 668, 1988 431n
- Convention on the Rights of the Child, 20 Nov. 1989, UNGA res.
   44/25 5, 49, 64, 233, 328, 568, 570, 595
  - Art. 2 586n
  - Art. 3 50, 564n, 589n
  - Art. 9 564n, 567n, 573n, 575, 578, 605

Table of treaties

	Art. 10	474n, 564n, 577–8, 580, 605
	Art. 16	566n
	Art. 18(1)	567n
	Art. 22	58, 78n, 473, 581n, 586n, 605
	Art. 38	439n
	Art. 39	75
	Art. 40	74, 473n, 483
	Art. 44	639n
1990	African Ch	narter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, UNHCR,
	Collection o	f International Instruments and Other Legal Texts Concerning
	Refugees an	d Displaced Persons, UNHCR, Geneva, 1995, vol. II,
	pp. 65–83	567n, 581–2n, 585–6n, 592, 605
1990	Conventio	n Determining the State Responsible for Examining
	Applicatio	ons for Asylum Lodged in One of the Member States of the
	European	Community (Dublin Convention), OJ 1997 L254, 19 Aug.
	1997, p. 1	187, 210, 212, 591
1990	Internatio	nal Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant
	Workers a	nd Members of their Families, UN doc. A/RES/45/158
		, 639n, 650n
1990	1990 Schengen Convention Applying the Schengen Agreement of 14 Jun	
		ne Gradual Abolition of Checks at Their Common Border, 30
	ILM 84, 19	
1993		nvention on Protection of Children and Cooperation in
		Intercountry Adoption, UNHCR, Collection of International
		s and Other Legal Texts Concerning Refugees and Displaced Persons,
	UNHCR, Geneva, 1995, vol. I, pp. 356–69 589n	
1993 Statute of the International Criminal Tribunal for the Forme		
		a, UNSC res. 827 (1993) 434–7, 480
1993 Convention on the Prohibition of the Development, Production,		
		g and use of Chemical Weapons and on Their Destruction
1001		Weapons Convention) 648n
1994		the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda, UNSC res.
1005	935 and 9	
1995		l Protocol to the European Social Charter Providing for a
1006	system of Collective Complaints of 9 Nov. 1995 650n Comprehensive Nuclear Test-Ban Treaty 648n	
1996 1996		Social Charter, ETS No. 163 566n
1996		I to the 1980 Convention on Certain Conventional Weapons on
1990		ons or Restrictions on the Use of Mines, Booby-Traps and Other
		s amended on 3 May 1996 648n
1997		on on the Prohibition of the Use, Stockpiling, Production
1.5.5/		fer of Anti-Personnel Mines, 18 Sept. 1997 (Ottawa
	Conventio	
	Conventio	11 <i>)</i> 010

1997	Treaty on European Union (consolidated version incorporating Treaty of Amsterdam), OJ 1997 C340, 10 Nov. 1997, pp. 145–72 633n
1997	Treaty Establishing the European Community (consolidated version incorporating Treaty of Amsterdam), OJ 1997 C340, 10 Nov. 1997, pp. 173–308 633n, 649n, 656n
1998	International Convention for the Suppression of Terrorist Bombings,37 ILM 249, 1998431, 441, 446
1998	Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, UN doc.
	A/CONF.183/9, 17 July 1998 38, 49, 73–4, 322, 336, 434–9, 444, 453, 468, 472n, 473, 480, 647n
1999	Optional Protocol of 6 Oct. 1999 to the 1979 Convention on the
	Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, UN doc. A/RES/54/4 49,650n
2000	Convention on Transnational Organized Crime, UN doc. A/55/383,
	Nov. 2000 21n, 61n
2000	International Convention for the Suppression of the Financing of
2000	Terrorism, Annex to UNGA res. 54/109, 25 Feb. 2000431, 442, 446Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the
2000	Involvement of Children in Armed Conflict, UNGA res. 54/263, 25
	May 2000 49, 58, 74
2000	Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the
	Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography, UNGA res.
	54/263, 25 May 2000 49, 58
2000	Protocol Against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air,
	Supplementing the 2000 UN Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime, UN doc. A/55/383, Nov. 2000 21n, 202, 207
2000	Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons,
2000	Especially Women and Children, supplementing the 2000 UN
	Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime, UN doc.
	A/55/383, Nov. 2000 21n, 61n, 207, 330n
2001	Asian-African Legal Consultative Organization, Principles Concerning
	Treatment of Refugees (consolidated text), 24 June 2001 90n
2001	EU Council of Ministers, Directive on Minimum Standards for Giving
	Temporary Protection in the Event of a Mass Influx of Displaced Persons
	and on Measures Promoting a Balance of Efforts Between Member States in Receiving Such Persons and Bearing the Consequences Thereof, 20
	July 2001 32n, 120n, 522, 523n, 582n, 589
2001	International Law Commission, Articles on State Responsibility, 31 May
	2001 10,108–9
2002	Protocol No. 13 to the 1950 European Human Rights Convention,
	concerning the abolition of the death penalty in all circumstances, May
	2002, ETS No. 187 13

# Abbreviations

African Charter on Human and Peoples'
Rights (Banjul Charter), 1981
American Convention on Human Rights,
1969
All England Law Reports (UK)
Australian Law Reports
Principles Covering Treatment of Refugees,
adopted by the Asian-African Legal
Consultative Committee, 1966
African Charter on Human and Peoples'
Rights, 1981
Board of Immigration Appeals (USA)
Bundesverwaltungsgericht (Federal
Administrative Court, Germany)
Bundesverfassungsgericht (Federal
Constitutional Court, Germany)
Court of Appeal
Ad Hoc Committee of Experts on Legal
Aspects of Territorial Asylum, Refugees and
Stateless Persons (Council of Europe)
Cartagena Declaration on Refugees, 1984
Bureau of Central Asia, South-West Asia,
North Africa and the Middle East (within
UNHCR)
Convention Against Torture, 1984
Centre for Documentation and Research
(within UNHCR)
Convention on the Elimination of
Discrimination Against Women, 1979
Convention on the Elimination of All Forms
of Racial Discrimination, 1965
Code of Federal Regulations (USA)

CIREFCA	International Conference on Central
	American Refugees
CJ	Chief Justice
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989
CRDD	Convention Refugee Determination
	Division (Canada)
CRR	Commission des recours des réfugiés (Refugee
	Appeals Commission, France)
DAC	Development Assistance Committee (OECD)
DIP	Division of International Protection (within
	UNHCR) until 1999; Department of
	International Protection from 1999
DLR	Dominion Law Reports
ECHR	European Convention for the Protection of
	Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms,
	1950
ECOSOC	UN Economic and Social Council
ECRE	European Council on Refugees and Exiles
EHRR	European Human Rights Reports
ELENA	European Legal Network on Asylum (ECRE)
EPAU	Evaluation and Policy Analysis Unit (within
	UNHCR)
ETS	European Treaty Series
Executive Committee	Executive Committee of the High
	Commissioner's Programme
FCA	Federal Court of Australia
FGM	female genital mutilation
HCA	High Court of Australia
HCHR	High Commissioner for Human Rights
HRC	Human Rights Committee
IAA	Immigration Appellate Authority (UK)
IARLJ	International Association of Refugee Law
	Judges
IAT	Immigration Appeal Tribunal (UK)
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and
	Political Rights, 1966
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social
	and Cultural Rights, 1966
ICJ	International Court of Justice
-	-

ICDC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICRC	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	
	Former Yugoslavia
ICVA	International Council of Voluntary Agencies
IFA	internal flight alternative
IFRCRCS	International Federation of Red Crescent
	and Red Cross Societies
ILC	International Law Commission
ILM	International Legal Materials
ILO	International Labor Organization
ILR	International Law Reports
Imm AR	Immigration Appeal Reports (UK)
INA	Immigration and Nationality Act (USA)
INLA	Irish National Liberation Army
INLR	Immigration and Nationality Law Reports
INS	Immigration and Naturalization Service
	(USA)
IOM	International Organization for Migration
IPA	internal protection alternative
IRA	internal relocation alternative
IRB	Immigration and Refugee Board (Canada)
IRO	International Refugee Organization
J	Justice
LCHR	Lawyers Committee for Human Rights
LNTS	League of Nations Treaty Series
MINBYUN	Lawyers for a Democratic Society (Republic
	of Korea)
NGO	non-governmental organization
NPT	Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear
	Weapons
NVwZ	Neue Zeitschrift für Verwaltungsrecht
NZLR	New Zealand Law Reports
OAS	Organization of American States
OAU	Organization of African Unity (African
	Union from 2002)
OAU Refugee Convention	OAU Convention Governing the Specific
5	Aspects of Refugee Problems in Africa, 1969
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and
	Development
OGH	<i>Oberster Gerichtshof</i> (Supreme Court, Austria)
OJ	Official Journal of the European Communities
~J	Summing and the European Communities

DCH	
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
QBD	Queen's Bench Division (UK)
RBAC	Regional Bureau for the Americas and the
PDDE	Caribbean (within UNHCR)
RDDE Defl av	Revue du droit des étrangers
RefLex	Digest of Canadian immigration and
	refugee law decisions of the IRB, CRDD,
	Immigration Appeal Division (IAD),
	Adjudication Division (AD), and of the
	Federal Court of Canada, available at
	http://www.irb.gc.ca/Legal/reflex/ index.e.stm
Refworld	UNHCR CD-ROM database of
Retworld	
	refugee-related information including case law and treaties
DEV	
REK	<i>Rechtseenheidskamer</i> (Law Unity Chamber, the Netherlands)
RRT	Refugee Review Tribunal (Australia)
RSAA	
KJAA	Refugee Status Appeals Authority (New Zealand)
RWLG	Refugee Women's Legal Group (UK)
SCIP	Sub-Committee of the Whole on
SCIP	International Protection (of the Executive
	Committee)
SCR	Supreme Court Reports (Canada)
SOPEMI	Continuous Reporting System on Migration
SOLEMI	(OECD)
TPS	temporary protected status (USA)
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights,
	1948
UKTS	United Kingdom Treaty Series
UN	United Nations
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and
	Cultural Organization
UNFPA	United Nations Fund for Population
	Activities
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNGAOR	United Nations General Assembly Official Records
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for
	Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund

# UNITA

UNITA	National Union for the Total Independence of Angola
Universal Declaration	Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1948
UNREF	United Nations Refugee Fund
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
USC	United States Code
WARIPNET	West African NGOs for Refugees and
	Internally Displaced Persons (Senegal)
WLR	Weekly Law Reports (UK)
ZaöRV	Zeitschrift für ausländisches öffentliches Recht und Völkerrecht